

ISO/IEC JTC 1/SC 2
CODED CHARACTER SETS
SECRETARIAT: JAPAN (JISC)

DOC TYPE: Summary of Voting/Table of Replies

TITLE: Summary of Voting on SC 2 N 3437, ISO/IEC FCD 6937, Coded graphic character set for text communication -- Latin alphabet (Revision of ISO/IEC 6937:1994)

SOURCE: Secretariat, ISO/IEC JTC 1/SC 2

PROJECT: JTC 1.02.02.14.01/02

STATUS: This document is forwarded to WG 3 for consideration. WG 3 is asked to prepare a disposition of comments report, revised text, and a recommendation to SC 2 for further processing.

ACTION ID: FYI

DUE DATE:

DISTRIBUTION: P, O and L Members of ISO/IEC JTC 1/SC 2
WG Conveners and Secretariats
Secretariat, ISO/IEC JTC 1
ISO/IEC ITTF

NO. OF PAGES: 11

ACCESS LEVEL: Defined

WEB ISSUE #: 094

Summary of Voting on SC 2 N 3437, ISO/IEC FCD 6937, Coded graphic character set for text communication -- Latin alphabet (Revision of ISO/IEC 6937:1994)

P-Member	Approve	Approve with comments	Disapprove	No Response	Comments
Armenia				X	
Austria				X	
Belgium	X				
Brazil	X				
Canada			X*		Attachment 1
China	X				
Denmark	X				
Egypt	X				
Finland			X		Attachment 2
France				X	
Germany		X			Attachment 3
Greece	X				
Iceland				X	
India				X	
Iran, Islamic Republic of				X	
Ireland	X				
Israel	X				
Italy	X				
Japan			X*		Attachment 4
Korea, Dem. P. Rep. Of				X	
Korea Rep. of	X				
Mongolia	X				
Morocco				X	
Netherlands		X			Attachment 5
Norway	X				
Poland	X				
Romania	X				
Russian Federation				X	
Singapore				X	
Slovenia	X				
Sweden			X		Attachment 6
Thailand	X				
Tunisia				X	
Turkey	X				
USA	X				
Yugoslavia	X				
	19	2	4	11	
Total (36)		21	4	11	
O-Member					
Czech Republic		X			Attachment 7

*= Acceptance of these reasons and appropriate changes in the text will change our vote to approval.

Attachment 1 - Canada

Canada votes NEGATIVE on the proposed revision text for ISO/IEC FCD 6937 in document SC2/N 3437 with the following comments. Our vote will be reversed if our comments are accommodated satisfactorily during the disposition of comments.

A. Ligatures / Letters - Æ, æ, Œ and œ

1. Characters æ and Æ have been moved in the table from the column "ligatures" to "others". There should be a note added to indicate also the discrepancy between the notion of ligature in the UCS and ligature as used here.
2. For the French language œ and Œ are not mere typographical ligatures but characters required for correct spelling, although they are not letters per se. To avoid the term ligature or to indicate a difference, they should be at least informally documented between parenthesis as joined digraphs after their official name. Note 3 is therefore incorrect. OE is not a letter per se in French. It is a joined digraph required for correct spelling, mandatory in certain sequences of oe's and forbidden in others.
3. A note should also be added to indicate that the letters æ and Æ are used as joined digraphs in French and in English, and that they are not considered individual letters in these languages, as in many other languages. For this one, it might be a political issue with the Scandinavian countries but an officious name could be added between parenthesis after their name as "(joined digraph ae and AE).

B. Clause 5.3:

1. In 5.3, it should be indicated that UCS ids are added as a separate column, and that alignment to 10646 is made for names.
2. Canada also proposes that the repertoire elements of ISO/IEC 6937 be specified with USIs (USI = Universal sequence identifier - a sequence of UCS ids - reference SC2/WG2 N 2230) as proposed by US (authored by Dr Umamaheswaran, CAC/SC2 chair) to indicate equivalence with UCS repertoire. The USIs are expected to be discussed in WG2 meeting in Athens and if accepted should be used in 6937.

C. Clause 8.1

1. The words "G0 set of ISO/IEC 10367" should be replaced by "G0 set identified by international registration number XXX". This is to avoid revising 6937 if 10367 is ever withdrawn or replaced. 6937 does not require that reference.
2. The registration number of the supplementary set should be documented in 8.1 third paragraph.
3. The whole of section 8.1 should make consistent references to table ("Table 2" should read "table 2", or "table 1" should read "Table 1") -- check the cases.
4. In the third paragraph backward from the end of 8.1 change "which shall not be used" by "which are reserved as specified in section 8.2".
5. A note should be added indicating that shaded positions 00/00 to 01/15 and 07/15 to 09/15 are outside of the scope of this sandard.

D. Annex B

1. The table containing short identifiers in Annex B should be merged with Table 4 and UCS ids added.
2. In note 16, replace the last sentence by "The use of non-spacing diacritical marks is limited to the combinations implied by the following table".

E. Annex E

1. Annex E should recognize that 10646 can also be used to accomplish the same goal, without using combining sequences, for the whole repertoire of 6937, as hinted by the UCS ids to be added.

F. Annex F

1. Annex F should be checked for accuracy and completeness (for example reference [6] is either wrong or should be deleted)
2. The international registry standard is missing from the normative references and is required.

Attachment 2 - Finland

Finland (SFS) votes AGAINST this FCD.

This revision of the standard is misleading at best. This is an old standard with limited current use and hardly any new application, and the revision of the standard would give the appearance of a real revision of it, against which a decision has been made (since this standard is a limiting one, defining how to close a set, as opposed to being an enabling standard, which would allow taking into consideration any other developments in the encoding of graphic characters, e.g. the addition of new combinations of base characters with diacritical marks and EURO SIGN).

If any update of the standard is required at all (which is highly unlikely in light of the limited, stable user community), this could be done in the form a technical corrigendum as opposed to a revision.

Attachment 3 - Germany

The German vote on ISO/IEC 6937 is Yes with comments.

Comment:

Add a note to LATIN SMALL LETTER L WITH MIDDLE DOT, LATIN CAPITAL LETTER L WITH MIDDLE DOT and LATIN SMALL LETTER N PRECEDED BY APOSTROPHE to clarify that these are deprecated characters and should better be encoded as l / L followed by middle dot and apostrophe followed by n respectively.

Attachment 4 - Japan

TITLE: Vote on FCD6937
SOURCE: Japanese National Body
DATE: 2000-09-04

Japan disapproves the FCD6937 (SC2 N3437) with the following comments. All the comments are editorial but vital. When these comments are accepted, Japan will change its vote to approval.

COMMENTS:

J-1 3. Normative references

Change the name of standard as follows.

ISO/IEC 10646:2000 ----> ISO/IEC 10646-1:2000

J-2 Table 1, A.1 and A.2

Change the shapes of graphic symbols of "GRAVE ACCENT" and "non-spacing grave accent" at the code positions

06/00 and 12/01	in the Table 1,
06/00	in the Table A.1, and
04/01	in the Table A.2

as follows.

‘ -----> -

J-3 Table 2

Change the character name of the bit combination 12/02 in the Table 2 as follows.

"non-spacing grave accent"
----> "non-spacing acute accent".

J-4 10.3 Identification of primary and supplementary sets

Change the first two explanations of escape sequences for designations, as:

ESC 02/08 04/02: to designate the primary set of the present edition of this International Standard (ISO-IR 6) as the G0 set;

ESC 02/13 05/02: to designate the supplementary set of the present edition of this International Standard (ISO-IR 156) as the G1 set.

RATIONALE:

"(ISO-IR 6)" does not mean the entire function of "to designate ... as the G0 set", but only "the primary set of the present edition of this International Standard". A parenthesized phrase for annotation should immediately follow the annotated phrase. Similarly, "(ISO-IR 156)" only means "the supplementary set of the present edition of this International Standard".

NOTE:

The sentences of FCD are not changed from ones of current version of

ISO/IEC 6937.

J-4.1 Note of 10.3

By the same reason as J-4's, change the first two explanation of escape sequences for designations, as:

ESC 02/08 04/00: to designate the primary set (ISO-IR 2) as the G0 set;

ESC 02/09 06/12: to designate the primary set (ISO-IR 90) as the G1 set.

J-5 Table 4

For ease of reference, add a graphic symbol of each character into the Table 4, as follows.

Name	Graphic symbol	Coded representation
ACUTE ACCENT	'	12/02 02/00
AMPERSAND	&	02/06

RATIONALE:

Table C.1 and D.1 show the graphic symbols of combined characters, which are too small to be recognized by their proper shapes. Furthermore, this FCD gives no easy way to recognize the correspondence between name of each combined character and its graphic symbol.

NOTE:

This comment is also for improvement of the current version of ISO/IEC 6937.

J-6 Annex A

Change the name of standard described in the final paragraph of Annex A, as:

ISO 2022 ----> ISO/IEC 2022.

J-7 Table D.1

Each combination of short ID, graphic symbol and x-mark does not form a vertical line as follows.

L	LLLLL	LLLLL	I
A	AAAAA	CCCCC	I
1	22345	11224	2
9	37131	15191	1
2	22345	11234	2
0	48242	26202	2
ã	ãåāæ	ćĉčç	ć
Ă	ĂĂĂĂ	ĆĆĆĆ	Ĭ
		x	

Adjust each graphic symbol immediately under its short ID.

Furthermore, in order to make this table easier to read, insert vertical lines between short IDs as follows.

Character	L	L	L	L	L	L											
	A	A	A	A	A	A											
	1	1	1	1	1	2											
	1	3	5	7	9	3											
	1	1	1	1	2	2											
	2	4	6	8	0	4											
	á	à	â	ä	ã												
Languages	Á	À	Â	Ä	Ã												
Afrikaans	x		x														
Albanian																	
Basque																	
Breton																	
Catalan	x	x															
Croat																	
Czech	x																
Danish	x																
Dutch	x	x															
English				x													

---end---

Attachment 5 - Netherlands

VOTE OF THE NETHERLANDS NB ON CD 6937(SC2 N 3437)

Our vote is APPROVAL with comments (editorial)

Comments

Some definitions (see list below) are different from those included in ISO/IEC 10646-1:2000 for the same term. It is only because we perceived that some people interpret these differences as being intentional, which it is not to our opinion, that we request now that the definitions listed below be replaced by those from ISO/IEC 10646-1:2000.

6937 10646-1

4.6 4.9 coded character set

4.8 4.10 code table

4.13 4.20 graphic character

4.15 4.33 repertoire

Swedish comments to NO vote on FCD 6937 (SC 2 N 3437)

The basis for the present revision is SC 2 resolution M 07.23, referring to document SC 2 N 2937R. The target date given in that document for IS publication is 1999-04. It now appears that publication may actually become delayed by more than two years. This fact has influenced the Swedish NB in its review of the FCD.

Sweden now shares, in principle, the concerns expressed in the Finnish comments to the earlier CD ballot. If the revision of ISO/IEC 6937 is to be proceeded with, the N2937R condition "There will be no additions to the repertoire" must, in the opinion of the Swedish NB, be modified. A revision at this late date must add the Euro sign to the repertoire. Also, the Welsh letters given in Annex D Note 4 should be added (in tables 4, B.1 and C.1), considering that they are now defined in the "Celtic" part of ISO/IEC 8859.

Further the following changes are suggested:

Table 1, Table A.1 and Table A.2 should be aligned layout-wise with ISO/IEC 8859, and preferably the same font used as there. Further, dotted circles should be added to indicate the positions of the "non-spacing" diacritical marks. The text of clause 8 will need to be modified accordingly. A proposed layout for Table 1 is appended to these comments.

In table 2 an "Identifier" column should be added, like in the ISO/IEC 8859, giving the UCS coding of the characters. This, also, will impact the text of clause 8.

A spelling error ("depreciated") occurs in Annex D Note 3.

In Table D.1 the language entry "Lapp (Sami)" must be changed to "Sami".

The document as a whole should conform to the SC 2/WG 3 decision to use a combined A4 / Letter size format. Also - as stated in other comments - the Swedish NB prefers a two-column layout; this is clearly desirable for user convenience.

Suggested revised ISO/IEC 6937 Table 1 layout

				b ₈	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	1	1	1	1	1	1	1	1	
				b ₇	0	0	0	0	1	1	1	1	0	0	0	0	1	1	1	1	
				b ₆	0	0	1	1	0	0	1	1	0	0	1	1	0	0	1	1	
				b ₅	0	1	0	1	0	1	0	1	0	1	0	1	0	1	0	1	
					00	01	02	03	04	05	06	07	08	09	10	11	12	13	14	15	
b ₄	b ₃	b ₂	b ₁																		
0	0	0	0	00			SP	0	à	P	`	p			NBSP	°	☒	—	Ω	κ	0
0	0	0	1	01			!	1	A	Q	a	q			ı	±	◌̇	´	Æ	æ	1
0	0	1	0	02			"	2	B	R	b	r			¢	²	◌̇	®	Đ	đ	2
0	0	1	1	03			#	3	C	S	c	s			£	³	◌̇	©	à	ǎ	3
0	1	0	0	04			\$	4	D	T	d	t			€	×	◌̇	™	Ĥ	ĥ	4
0	1	0	1	05			%	5	E	U	e	u			¥	μ	◌̇	♪	☒	ı	5
0	1	1	0	06			&	6	F	V	f	v			☒	¶	◌̇	¬	IJ	ij	6
0	1	1	1	07			'	7	G	W	g	w			§	·	◌̇	¡	Ł	ł	7
1	0	0	0	08			(8	H	X	h	x			¤	÷	◌̇	☒	Ł	ł	8
1	0	0	1	09)	9	I	Y	i	y			‘	’	☒	☒	Ø	ø	9
1	0	1	0	10			*	:	J	Z	j	z			“	”	◌̇	☒	Œ	œ	A
1	0	1	1	11			+	;	K	[k	{			«	»	◌̇	☒	°	β	B
1	1	0	0	12			,	<	L	\	l				←	¼	☒	⅛	Ɔ	ɔ	C
1	1	0	1	13			-	=	M]	m	}			↑	½	◌̇	⅜	Ɔ	ɔ	D
1	1	1	0	14			.	>	N	^	n	~			→	¾	◌̇	⅝	Ɔ	ɔ	E
1	1	1	1	15			/	?	0	_	o				↓	¿	◌̇	⅞	'n	SHY	F
					0	1	2	3	4	5	6	7	8	9	A	B	C	D	E	F	hex

Attachment 7 - Czech Republic

CZECH REPUBLIC COMMENTS

Reference number: ISO/IEC JTC 1/SC 2 N3437

ISO/IEC FCD 6937

Title: Coded graphic character set for text communication - Latin alphabet (Revision of ISO/IEC 6937:1994)

Country: Czech Republic

Approval of the draft with comments as given on the attached:

- Page 9 (Table 1):

- a) graphic symbol of GRAVE ACCENT in 06/00 is not correct;
- b) graphic symbol of LATIN SMALL LETTER Z in 07/10 is not correct;
- c) graphic symbol of NON-SPACING GRAVE ACCENT in 12/01 is not correct;
- d) graphic symbol of FEMININE ORDINAL INDICATOR in 14/03 is not correct;
- e) graphic symbol of MASCULINE ORDINAL INDICATOR in 14/11 is not correct;
- h) acronym SP should be in 02/00;

- Page 11 (Table 3):

- a) *non-spacing acute accent* shall be in 12/02;

- Page 20 (Table A.1):

- a) graphic symbol of GRAVE ACCENT in 06/00 is not correct;

- Page 21 (Table A.2):

- a) graphic symbol of NON-SPACING GRAVE ACCENT in 04/01 is not correct;
- b) graphic symbol of FEMININE ORDINAL INDICATOR in 06/03 is not correct;
- c) graphic symbol of MASCULINE ORDINAL INDICATOR in 06/11 is not correct;