The contributing editors have done some additional research into the use of recycling symbols and found clear evidence that the existing proposal incorrectly conflates two sets of recycling symbols. These two sets are the Plastic Bottle Material Coding System and the set of Paper Recycling Symbols.

In addition to clarifying the relation between these two sets and identifying the missing characters for standardization, this paper also presents some of the related and more recent uses of iconic recycling related labels in other industries.

Plastic Bottle Material Code System
The seven numbered logos encoded from U+2673-267A are from “The Plastic Bottle Material Code System,” introduced in 1988 by the Society of the Plastics Industry (SPI) (see http://www.socplas.org). This set consistently uses thin, two-dimensional curved arrows suitable for use in plastics molding. Glyph variations using the thicker, folded arrows can sometimes be found in publications, possibly as result of a mistake on part of the graphic artist. They are not commonly found on products or packaging, nor on the bottle manufacturers’ web sites.

As of January 1995, 39 US states had adopted legislation regarding the use of this resin identification code system on bottles of 16 ounces or more and rigid containers of 8 ounces or more. The SPI code described above is the one being used. For example, labeling with these symbols is required by sections 459A.685 and 459A.680 of the 1997 Oregon Revised Statutes for all rigid plastic containers. The statutes provide a description, but no images, of the symbols.
The code shall consist of a number placed inside a triangle and letters placed below the triangle. The triangle shall be equilateral, formed by three arrows with the apex of each point of the triangle at the midpoint of each arrow, rounded with a short radius. The pointer of each arrow shall be at the midpoint of each side of the triangle with a short gap separating the pointer from the base of the adjacent arrow. The triangle, formed by the three arrows curved at their midpoints, shall depict a clockwise path around the code number.

— 1997 Oregon Revised Statutes

Note that these statutes make no requirements that such labels be licensed from a particular source, nor do they set up certification and or detailed technical specification for which types of plastics get which label.

**Recycling Symbol for Generic Materials**

An un-numbered plastic resin code symbol (△) is not formally part of the SPI system, but is found in many fonts. Occasional use of this symbol as a generic materials code symbol can be found in the field, usually with a text legend below, but sometimes also surrounding (or overlaid by) other text or symbols (see Recycling Symbols for Glass).

Observed variations include the symbol with the words “Ni-Cd” or “CFC-12” written below to identify the presence of nickel-cadmium batteries or Chlorinated Fluorocarbon refrigerant in a product, which must be recycled. Sometimes, the UNIVERSAL RECYCLING SYMBOL is substituted for the generic symbol in this context, but the clear semantic distinction between emphasis on recyclability and actual materials classification argues for encoding the generic symbol distinctly from the UNIVERSAL RECYCLING SYMBOL.

Such usage is clearly productive. In our view, the best solution for the standard is to provide the common element as a freestanding character and not make any assumptions about combining nature.

**Paper Recycling Symbols**

The paper recycling symbols were designed at a different and in a different context from the plastics recycling symbols. They were derived by the American Forest and Paper Association (AF&PA) from the inventor’s original prize-winning design for the Universal Recycling Symbol (see History of the Universal Recycling Symbol below).

There are four variations of this symbol for use in labeling paper products:

- white arrows without circle
- black arrows without circle
- black circle with white arrows symbol
- black arrows symbol with white circle

The first two are common glyph variants of the UNIVERSAL RECYCLING SYMBOL (△) used to indicate that the material (in this case paper) is recyclable. The white form
is the traditional version of the symbol, but presumably because its thin outlines do not always reproduce well, the black form is substituted at times. The latter two of these can be used to distinguish full and partial recycled fiber content. The recommendation of the American Forest and Paper Organization (AF&PA) is that qualifying text be placed next to the symbol. The following two examples show text, but not the text recommended by the AF&PA – here there is no mention of the fiber content on the right. These examples also show the black glyph variation for the UNIVERSAL RECYCLING SYMBOL on the left.

The following scan from an insurance-company billing envelope demonstrates the fact that the distinction between recycled content and recyclable material is being made:

1. Include the proper portion of the notice.
2. Insert so company name shows through window.
3. If you have moved, contact your agent.
4. Check postage as the Postal Service will not deliver without postage.
5. Do not fold, staple or paper clip documents together.

These symbols are in the public domain. Their use is not prescribed, but in the US is subject to the Federal Trade Commission's Guides for the Use of Environmental Marketing Claims. See [http://www.ftc.gov/bcp/grnrule/guides980427.htm](http://www.ftc.gov/bcp/grnrule/guides980427.htm).


**Recycling Symbols for Glass**

There are two common symbols for glass recycling, which can be found printed on the labels for glass bottles and on some manufacturers’ and recycling organizations’ websites.

So far, no ultimate source or controlling organization has been found for the first of these two labels. The “G” shaped one is sponsored by the Glass Packaging Institute (GPI), which places no restrictions on its use. See [http://www.gpi.org/G.html](http://www.gpi.org/G.html). Both symbols
have not been seen together. Such labeling for glass bottles appears to be relatively recent as evidenced by the competing logos and the fact that unlike the resin coding symbols for plastic bottles, they are not present on all glass bottles.

Glass bottles can be easily identified by the end-user, so the driving force behind the use of these particular efforts appears to be consistency in making environmental marketing claims or possibly a sort of ‘symbol envy’ of glass bottlers towards their competitors using plastics.

**Recycling Symbol for Steel**

Possibly because steel can be identified and separated by magnet (and thus does not need to be labeled for sorting) this use is not widespread and the Steel Recycling Institute does not provide information about this label.

**The Green Dot**
The Green Dot is a symbol first introduced in 1994 by Duales System Deutschland, which implemented a novel financing system for recovering packaging by licensing the green dot

![Image of green dot]

To its manufacturers and setting up a system to collect used packaging bearing this symbol from the end-user. Since 1994 this system has been adopted in eleven European countries altogether. See [http://www.greendot.ie](http://www.greendot.ie).

The widespread and transnational use of this symbol would appear to make it a good candidate for encoding in an International Standard. However, use of this symbol requires a licensing contract between manufacturer and a partner company in the PRO-Europe association. Therefore the green dot could not be considered for encoding without a request from the trademark owners. In this regard it is different from the other recycling symbols.

**The PITCH-IN symbol**
This symbol of a stylized person cleaning up the environment was adopted in 1976 as stated on the website of PITCH-IN Canada ([http://www.pitch-in.ca/](http://www.pitch-in.ca/)) which is associated Clean World International, a non-profit organization with worldwide membership.
Unlike the other recycling symbols, this symbol is not primarily used to identify materials for separation (however a variant of this design occurs as part of the glass-recycling symbol) but it is widely used in the context of public education and outreach for anti-littering efforts (with or without recycling component). The use of this symbol is not limited to one country and therefore makes it a good candidate for inclusion in an international standard.

Other materials
Materials commonly recycled by end users also include aluminum and motor oil. There does not seem to be a consistent set of symbols for labeling products using or consisting of these materials. Standardization of character codes can be postponed until a consistent usage has been developed.

History of the Universal Recycling Symbol
The universal recycling symbol (shown below left) was invented by Gary Anderson in 1970 as part of a contest sponsored by a paper company. The design is deliberately based on a Möbius strip, i.e. an endless loop that has only one surface. The symbol is not trademarked, which has lead to the creation of a large set of derived symbols or logos. A recent example is shown below right.

For more on the history of this symbol and the paper recycling symbols that were derived from it, see [http://www.afandpa.org/recycling/anders.pdf](http://www.afandpa.org/recycling/anders.pdf)

Summary
Because the materials covered in this document represent the bulk of commonly recycled materials the authors recommend to proceed with the partial set of well-established symbols. They cover the most widespread usage and suffer least from the ongoing development.

Related Documents

Proposal to encode two ecological symbols ISO/IEC 10646 (1997-12-08) [http://www.dkuug.dk/JTC1/SC2/WG2/docs/n1661.htm](http://www.dkuug.dk/JTC1/SC2/WG2/docs/n1661.htm)
List of Recycling symbols

1. The Unicode Standard should add the following annotation to its nameslist:
   2672 🌿 UNIVERSAL RECYCLING SYMBOL
       used as generic symbol for recycling or to indicate that material is recyclable

2. The reference glyphs should include the shorthand notation for the resin into the glyph
   to match legislative requirements and usage by the sponsoring authority and industry
   2673 📠 RECYCLING SYMBOL FOR TYPE-1 PLASTICS
   2674 📠 RECYCLING SYMBOL FOR TYPE-2 PLASTICS
   2675 📠 RECYCLING SYMBOL FOR TYPE-3 PLASTICS
   2676 📠 RECYCLING SYMBOL FOR TYPE-4 PLASTICS
   2677 📠 RECYCLING SYMBOL FOR TYPE-5 PLASTICS
   2678 📠 RECYCLING SYMBOL FOR TYPE-6 PLASTICS
   2679 📠 RECYCLING SYMBOL FOR TYPE-7 PLASTICS

3. The following characters are identified as missing from the current repertoire of recycling symbols. Annotations are suggested for the nameslist in The Unicode Standard:
   (再生) RECYCLED PAPER
       use to indicate 100% recycled content
   (リサイクル) PARTIALLY RECYCLED PAPER
       indicate the percentage in overlay or next to this symbol
   (リサイクル) RECYCLING SYMBOL FOR GENERIC MATERIALS
       used together with other text and labels to indicate the type of material

4. These symbols are additional candidates for encoding:
   (パイプ) PITCH-IN SYMBOL
   (黒) BLACK UNIVERSAL RECYCLING SYMBOL

5. These symbols need additional research
   (リサイクル) RECYCLING SYMBOL FOR GLASS-1
   (リサイクル) RECYCLING SYMBOL FOR GLASS–2