Ballot Information

Reference	ISO/IEC FDIS 15897 (Ed 2)	**Committee**	ISO/IEC JTC 1/SC 35
Edition number	2		

English title

Information technology -- User interfaces -- Procedures for the registration of cultural elements -- Part 111:

French title

Technologies de l'information -- Interfaces utilisateur -- Procédures pour l'enregistrement des éléments culturels -- Partie 111:

Start date	2011-02-22	**End date**	2011-04-22
Opened by ISO/CS on	2011-02-22 00:02:43	**Closed by ISO/CS on**	2011-04-25 12:36:40
Status	Closed		
Voting stage	Approval	**Version number**	1
Note			

Result of voting

P-Members voting: 12 in favour out of 16 = 75 % (requirement >= 66.66%)

(P-Members having abstained are not counted in this vote.)

Member bodies voting: 4 negative votes out of 18 = 22 % (requirement <= 25%)

Approved

Votes by members					
Country	Member	Status	Approval	Disapproval	Abstention
Armenia	SARM	P-Member			X
Australia	SA	P-Member			X
Belgium	NBN	P-Member			X
Canada	SCC	P-Member	X *		
China	SAC	P-Member	X		
Côte d'Ivoire	CODINORM	P-Member			X
Czech Republic	UNMZ	P-Member	X		
Denmark	DS	P-Member			X
Finland	SFS	P-Member			X
France	AFNOR	P-Member	X		
Germany	DIN	P-Member		X *	
India	BIS	P-Member			X
Ireland	NSAI	P-Member	X		
Italy	UNI	P-Member		X *	
Jamaica	BSJ	P-Member			X
Japan	JISC	P-Member	X		
Kenya	KEBS	P-Member	X		
Korea, Republic of	KATS	P-Member	X		
Lebanon	LIBNOR	P-Member			
Luxembourg	ILNAS	P-Member			X
Malaysia	DSM	P-Member			X
Malta	MSA	P-Member			X
Netherlands	NEN	P-Member			X
New Zealand	SNZ	P-Member			X
Nigeria	SON	P-Member	X		
Norway	SN	P-Member	X		
Pakistan	PSQCA	P-Member			
Romania	ASRO	O-Member	X		
Russian Federation	GOST R	P-Member	X		
Singapore	SPRING SG	P-Member			X
South Africa	SABS	P-Member			X
Spain	AENOR	P-Member			X
Sweden	SIS	P-Member	X		
Switzerland	SNV	P-Member			X
Ukraine	DSSU	O-Member	X		
United Kingdom	BSI	P-Member		X *	

USA	ANSI	Secretariat		X *	
P-Member TOTALS Total of P-Members voting: 16			12	4	17
TOTALS			14	4	17
(*) A comment file was submitted with this vote					

Comments from Voters			
Canada	**SCC**	**P-Member**	ISO_IEC_FDIS_15897_(Ed_2)_SCC.doc
Germany	**DIN**	**P-Member**	ISO_IEC_FDIS_15897_(Ed_2)_DIN.doc
Italy	**UNI**	**P-Member**	ISO_IEC_FDIS_15897_(Ed_2)_UNI.doc
United Kingdom	**BSI**	**P-Member**	ISO_IEC_FDIS_15897_(Ed_2)_BSI.doc
USA	**ANSI**	**Secretariat**	ISO_IEC_FDIS_15897_(Ed_2)_ANSI.doc

1	2	(3)	4	5	(6)	(7)
MB[1]	**Clause No./ Subclause No./ Annex** (e.g. 3.1)	**Paragraph/ Figure/Table/ Note** (e.g. Table 1)	**Type of com-ment**[2]	**Comment (justification for change) by the MB**	**Proposed change by the MB**	**Secretariat observations** on each comment submitted
US			ge	The US recommends a disapproval of the FDIS ballot for ISO/IEC 15897, Information technology - User interfaces - Procedures for registration of cultural elements. The registry regulated by ISO/IEC 15897 has been in place since 1997, and has gathered very little data - covering 4 locales in 1997 and 3 locales in 2001 (see http://std.dkuug.dk/cultreg/). The amount of data gathered by this effort is vastly insufficient for any practical use, and there is no sign that this situation will change. Furthermore, this registry is based on the model that was described in ISO/IEC TR 14652:2004, Information technology - Specification methods for cultural conventions, a TR that has been withdrawn. In contrast, the Unicode Common Locale Data Repository project, conducted by the Unicode Consortium, has gathered data about many locales (516 in the last release), often with orders of magnitude more data about each locale than can be found in the 15897 registry. The effort enjoys a broad support in the industry, both in terms of contributors and in terms of users. Finally, the project is very much		

1 **MB** = Member body (enter the ISO 3166 two-letter country code, e.g. CN for China; comments from the ISO/CS editing unit are identified by ******)

2 **Type of comment:**   **ge** = general   **te** = technical   **ed** = editorial

NOTE   Columns 1, 2, 4, 5 are compulsory.

ISO electronic balloting commenting template/version 2001-10

1	2	(3)	4	5	(6)	(7)
MB[1]	Clause No./ Subclause No./ Annex (e.g. 3.1)	Paragraph/ Figure/Table/ Note (e.g. Table 1)	Type of com-ment[2]	Comment (justification for change) by the MB	Proposed change by the MB	Secretariat observations on each comment submitted
				alive, with 9 releases since 2004. More details about the CLDR project can be found at http://www.unicode.org/cldr. It seems to us that currently, ISO activities around locale data do not satisfy the needs of the standardization community and in fact conflict with a widely adopted industry standard.		

1   **MB** = Member body (enter the ISO 3166 two-letter country code, e.g. CN for China; comments from the ISO/CS editing unit are identified by ******)

2   **Type of comment:**   **ge** = general   **te** = technical   **ed** = editorial

NOTE   Columns 1, 2, 4, 5 are compulsory.

ISO electronic balloting commenting template/version 2001-10

Date: 05 April 2011	Document: **ISO/IEC FDIS 15897**

1	2	(3)	4	5	(6)	(7)
MB[1]	Clause No./ Subclause No./ Annex (e.g. 3.1)	Paragraph/ Figure/Table/ Note (e.g. Table 1)	Type of com-ment[2]	Comment (justification for change) by the MB	Proposed change by the MB	Secretariat observations on each comment submitted
GB	Foreword Introduction Scope 3.2 3.6 10.1 10.2.5 10.2.6 12.1 (Clause 11) Annex H (H.1) Bibliography		Ge	The UK votes disapproval because the standard contains a significant number of references to ISO/IEC TR 14652, which has been withdrawn in April 2008.	All references to ISO/IEC TR 14652 should be deleted and the appropriate clauses reworded before publication	

1   **MB** = Member body (enter the ISO 3166 two-letter country code, e.g. CN for China; comments from the ISO/CS editing unit are identified by ******)

2   **Type of comment:**   **ge** = general   **te** = technical   **ed** = editorial

NOTE   Columns 1, 2, 4, 5 are compulsory.

ISO electronic balloting commenting template/version 2001-10

| Template for comments and secretariat observations | | | | | Date: 2011-04-05 | Document: ISO/FDIS 15897 |

1	2	(3)	4	5	(6)	(7)
MB [1]	Clause No./ Subclause No./ Annex (e.g. 3.1)	Paragraph/ Figure/Table/ Note (e.g. Table 1)	Type of com[2] ment	Comment (justification for change) by the MB	Proposed change by the MB	Secretariat observations on each comment submitted
DE	1 3.2 3.6 10.1 10.2.5 10.2.6 12.2 Clause11 Annex H.1 1)		ge	Germany disagrees for the following reasons: The FDIS 15897 references TR 14652 at several places. The TR has been withdrawn by ISO. Date of withdrawal: 2008-04-02. A new project has been approved for revising this withdrawn TR but it can not be referred to currently as there is no publication yet.	It has to go back to the drawing board till the material referenced through the TR is fixed. The registry and the procedures for registration still exist. This FDIS is a revision of the registration procedures. Therefore it is no problem to get the FDIS fixed at CD or DIS stage. When there will be a replacement published for TR 14652 the registration procedure should be synchronized at this time.	
DE	3.1	Note	ed	ISO/IEC 9945-1:2003 has been withdrawn: 2009-09-15	Check if the successor ISO/IEC 9945:2009 could be the reference.	
DE	3.3	Note	ed	ISO/IEC 9945-1:2003 has been withdrawn: 2009-09-15	Check if the successor ISO/IEC 9945:2009 could be the reference.	
DE	12.2	Clause 8	ed	ISO/IEC 9945-2:1993 has been withdrawn: 2009-09-15	Check if the successor ISO/IEC 9945:2009 could be the reference.	
DE	13	Note	ed	ISO/IEC 9945-2:1993 has been withdrawn: 2009-09-15	Check if the successor ISO/IEC 9945:2009 could be the reference.	
DE	Annex D.1	Clause 8	ed	ISO/IEC 9945-1:1990 and 9945-2:1993 have been withdrawn: 1996-11-28 and 2009-09-15	Check if the successor ISO/IEC 9945:2009 could be the reference.	
DE	Annex D.1	Clause 15	ed	DS/ISO/IEC 9945-1 should be withdrawn because ISO/IEC 9945-1 has been withdrawn 2009-09-15.	Check if the successor ISO/IEC 9945:2009 could be the reference.	
DE	Annex D.1	Clause 20	ed	It is referred to DS/ISO 1000.	Check if the reference could be ISO 1000.	
DE	Annex D.1	Clause 22	ed	It is referred to DS/ISO 8601.	Check if the reference could be ISO 8601.	
DE	Annex F.1	F.1	ed	ISO/IEC 9945-2:1993 has been withdrawn: 2009-09-15	Check if the successor ISO/IEC 9945:2009 could be the reference.	

1   **MB** = Member body (enter the ISO 3166 two-letter country code, e.g. CN for China; comments from the ISO/CS editing unit are identified by ******)

2   **Type of comment:**   **ge** = general   **te** = technical   **ed** = editorial

NOTE   Columns 1, 2, 4, 5 are compulsory.

ISO electronic balloting commenting template/version 2001-10

There is a problem in the FDIS with referencing TR 14652:2004, which is a withdrawn document (Canada had voted against withdrawal at the time because it was refered in this IS).

Canada contemplated voting NO, but realizing the flawed-reference removal could be made in considering this was editorial only, here are the proposed changes to make sure there remains no ambiguous reference to 14652 that could suggest it is a mandatory piece.

Foreword:

Existing text:

This International Standard registers amongst other items Narrative Cultural Specifications and repertoiremaps, POSIX Locales and POSIX Charmaps as defined in ISO/IEC 9945 "POSIX", and other machine parsable cultural specifications such as ISO/IEC TR 14652 FDCC-sets, charmaps and repertoiremaps, and cultural specifications in SGML or XML.

Replacement text:

This International Standard registers amongst other items Narrative Cultural Specifications and repertoiremaps, POSIX Locales and POSIX Charmaps as defined in ISO/IEC 9945 "POSIX", and other **machine-parsable** cultural specifications, **such as enhanced POSIX-compliant FDCC-sets**, charmaps and repertoiremaps, and cultural specifications in SGML or XML.

Introduction:

Existing text:

This edition of the International Standard adds support for registering specifications meant for machine processing such as ISO/IEC TR 14652 specifications, SGML and XML. It

[...]

The International Standard sets out the procedures for registering cultural elements, both as narrative text and in a more formal manner, using the techniques of ISO/IEC 9945 "POSIX", and other machine processable formats such as those specified in ISO/IEC TR 14652 "Specification method for cultural conventions", SGML or XML.

Replacement text:

This edition of the International Standard adds support for registering specifications meant for machine processing **such as enhanced POSIX-compliant specifications**, SGML and XML**. It**

[...]

The International Standard sets out the procedures for registering cultural elements, both as narrative text and in a more formal manner, using the techniques of ISO/IEC 9945 "POSIX", and other machine processable formats **such as enhanced POSIX-compliant specifications for cultural conventions**, SGML or XML.

1. Scope

Existing text:

The cultural specifications can include freeform Narrative Cultural Specifications and Repertoiremaps as described in this International Standard, POSIX Locales and Charmaps

conforming to ISO/IEC 9945, and other **machine-parsable** specifications such as FDCC-sets, repertoiremaps and charmaps **following the recommendations of ISO/IEC TR 14652**, and cultural specifications formatted using SGML or XML. The registry is in printed and electronic form.

A numeric identifier and a token identifier are assigned to each registered cultural convention specification, POSIX Locale, POSIX Charmap and Repertoiremap, FDCC-set **and ISO/IEC TR 14652 Charmap**, and other **machine processable** descriptions of cultural conventions.

Replacement text:

The cultural specifications can include freeform Narrative Cultural Specifications and Repertoiremaps as described in this International Standard, POSIX Locales and Charmaps conforming to ISO/IEC 9945, and other **machine-parsable** specifications such as FDCC-sets, repertoiremaps and charmaps **following the recommendations of enhanced POSIX-compliant specifications**, and cultural specifications formatted using SGML or XML. The registry is in printed and electronic form.

A numeric identifier and a token identifier are assigned to each registered cultural convention specification, POSIX Locale, POSIX Charmap and Repertoiremap, FDCC-set **and enhanced POSIX-compliant Charmap**, and other **machine-processable** descriptions of cultural conventions.

3.2 FDCC-set

Existing text:

NOTE   See Clause 4 of ISO/IEC TR 14652:2004 for a specification of the FDCC-set format.

This NOTE should be deleted.

3.6 Cultural specification

Existing text:

either a Narrative Cultural Specification, a POSIX Locale, an FDCC-set, a POSIX Charmap, a Repertoiremap, or other machine-processable description of cultural conventions **such as ISO/IEC TR 14652 FDCC-sets**, Charmaps or Repertoiremaps, or cultural specifications in SGML or XML

Replacement text:

either a Narrative Cultural Specification, a POSIX Locale, an FDCC-set, a POSIX Charmap, a Repertoiremap, or other machine-processable description of cultural conventions **such as enhanced POSIX-compliant FDCC-sets**, Charmaps or Repertoiremaps, or cultural specifications in SGML or XML

10.1 Types of Cultural Specifications

Existing text:

NOTE   As far as Repertoiremaps according to ISO/IEC TR 14652 are also in accordance with Clause 13, these can also be registered as Type 4.

This NOTE should be deleted.

Further text:

Types 5 and 6 are for specification of cultural conventions in a machine-parsable format, such as specified in ISO/IEC TR 14652, XML or SGML table formats. Any format is allowed as long as it is machine parsable and adheres to the following rules: It is a ISO/IEC TR 14652 FDCC-set, a ISO/IEC TR 14652 charmap, or the first line of the file identifies the file format.

Replacement text:

Types 5 and 6 are for specification of cultural conventions in a machine-parsable format, **such as specified in enhanced POSIX-compliant formats**, XML or SGML table formats. Any format is allowed as long as it is **machine-parsable** and adheres to the following rules: **It is a enhanced POSIX-compliant FDCC-set, a enhanced POSIX-compliant charmap**, or the first line of the file **that identifies** the file format.

10.2.5 Other machine-parsable Cultural Specifications

Existing text:

Some aspects of a Narrative Cultural Specification may be specified in formal syntax as an ISO/IEC TR 14652 FDCC-set, or other machine-parsable cultural specification, which may refer to the corresponding Narrative Cultural Specification. A ISO/IEC TR 14652 FDCC-set may refer to the Repertoiremap being used, and should also list one or more Charmaps that can be used.

Replacement text:

Some aspects of a Narrative Cultural Specification may be specified in formal syntax **as a enhanced POSIX-compliant FDCC-set**, or other machine-parsable cultural specification, which may refer to the corresponding Narrative Cultural Specification. **A enhanced POSIX-compliant FDCC-set** may refer to the Repertoiremap being used, and should also list one or more Charmaps that can be used.

10.2.6 Other machine parsable character set specifications

Existing text:

10.2.6 Other **machine parsable** character set specifications
[...]
In the case of a ISO/IEC TR 14652 Charmap, or other machine-parsable character set descriptions it shall specify aspects of a Narrative Cultural Specification or an FDCC-set that relate to coded character sets.

Replacement text:

10.2.6 Other machine-parsable character set specifications
[...]
In the case of a enhanced POSIX-compliant Charmap, or other machine-parsable character set descriptions it shall specify aspects of a Narrative Cultural Specification or an FDCC-set that relate to coded character sets.

12.2 Optional clauses

Clause 11: Transformation of characters

Existing text:

Examples of transliteration and fallback specifications in a syntax described in an earlier draft of

ISO/IEC TR 14652 may be found in the bibliographic reference 4.

Replacement text:

Examples of transliteration and fallback specifications **in a formal syntax** may be found in the bibliographic **reference [5]**.

H.1 Changes from ISO/IEC 15897:1999

Existing text:

1) Specifications from ISO/IEC TR 14652 and other machine parsable formats were added to the list of possible items for registration.

Replacement text:

1) Specifications from **enhanced POSIX-compliant formats** and other **machine-parsable** formats were added to the list of possible items for registration.

Bibliography

Existing text:

[5] A number of translitteration and fallback specifications in the syntax of an earlier draft of ISO/IEC TR 14652 may be found at:
http://sources.redhat.com/cgi-bin/cvsweb.cgi/libc/localedata/locales/?cvsroot=glibc

Replacement text:
[5] A number of translitteration and fallback specifications **in a formal syntax** may be found at: [...]

Template for comments and secretariat observations					Date: 2011-04-18	Document: **ISO/IEC FDIS 15897**

1	2	(3)	4	5	(6)	(7)
MB[1]	**Clause No./ Subclause No./ Annex** (e.g. 3.1)	**Paragraph/ Figure/Table/ Note** (e.g. Table 1)	**Type of com-ment**[2]	**Comment (justification for change) by the MB**	**Proposed change by the MB**	**Secretariat observations** on each comment submitted
IT			ge	The proposed document refers to ISO/IEC TR 14652. ISO/IEC TR 14652 is currently under revision. FDIS 15897 should not be approved until the new revised version of the ISO/IEC TR 14652 is available.		

G. L. Salerio – Head of International Area

1   **MB** = Member body (enter the ISO 3166 two-letter country code, e.g. CN for China; comments from the ISO/CS editing unit are identified by ******)

2   **Type of comment:**   **ge** = general   **te** = technical   **ed** = editorial

NOTE   Columns 1, 2, 4, 5 are compulsory.

ISO electronic balloting commenting template/version 2001-10