In his document L2/15-101, Srinidhi makes a commendable attempt at collecting un-encoded Vedic characters from non-Devanagari scripts. The following are my comments on his document. I shall make proposals for a few of these characters separately.

**Newar/Devanagari Middle Dot**
There is no sufficient evidence to analyse this character as a combining mark and even less as a svara (vowel). The linguistic contexts do not exhibit any noticeable consistency in the short sample provided and in any case they do not correspond to that of any vowels or other linguistic features commonly represented by combining marks in writing. As such there is insufficient argument as to why U+00B7 itself cannot be used.

**Other Newar/Devanagari characters**
The samples after that provide attestation for possible Vedic characters with the names of **RING BELOW, UPTURNED KNOT BELOW, BACKWARD-BENT UDatta** and **CANDRABINDU BELOW**. In the case of **RING BELOW**, one notes that we already have a **RING ABOVE** at U+1CF8 and a **DOT BELOW** at U+1CDD. Given that there too many cases of experimentation may be seen in old manuscripts, it is not clear whether U+1CDD **DOT BELOW** would not serve the purpose. Further evidence on the actual extent of usage of this character should be collected and experts (such as those who were consulted on the earlier Vedic proposal) should review it to determine whether it is really important to separately encode it.

The same is the case for **UPTURNED KNOT BELOW** and **BACKWARD-BENT UDatta** as well. In the case of **CANDRABINDU BELOW**, it is additionally not known what it actually represents.

**Tulu/Tigalari characters**
The proposal author has separately insisted many times to me in personal communications that the script in question should be called Tigalari. However, the same or a similar script has been called Tulu by others. This matter needs to be discussed with experts and I hope to do so in the forthcoming months.
The issue of script name aside, scholars natively using this script have fortuitously been present here at my very work place since the past few days. This has helped me analyse the samples provided and verify the identity of the svara markers used therein.

The first six samples are from the Rig Veda Samhita (9/19, 10/126, 1/4, 6/69, 9/39 and 9/32 respectively) and I was able to confirm that the Slanting Line Above and the Descending Staircase Below indeed denote the svarita and anudatta tones respectively.

The next two samples are from the Ashvalayana Shruta Sutra (2/5) and we were able to determine that the Upturned Candra Below in fact denotes the anudatta.

However, experts should again review the evidence determine whether:

a) it is important to separately encode characters for these alternate systems of representing the same svara-s, (or)

b) these may be considered as glyphic variants of already encoded characters such as the Slanting Line Above may be unified with U+0951, (or)

c) even if not, whether other already-encoded characters of dissimilar shape may be used instead, rejecting the old forms as experimentation.

Kannada and Tulu/Tigalari characters for the Sama Veda

So far the Tulu/Tigalari script has not been found to have a distinct set of numerals and the Kannada numerals are re-used in this script as well. Thus the Kannada digits are used as combining marks above for the Sama Vedic svara-s both in Kannada and Tulu/Tigalari. This is just as in Devanagari and Grantha. These are hence certainly valid candidates for encoding (with ScriptExtensions entries) and I shall be submitting a proposal for them.

The samples provided for this on p 13 are not from any published text which would be a preferred source of attestation but I have access to other sources.

Again as seen in Devanagari and Grantha, some syllables (A, KA, NA, PA and VI) are used as combining marks above for Sama Veda but these are certainly different between Kannada and Tulu/Tigalari. The Kannada characters can be proposed with the digit markers but the Tulu/Tigalari ones should be proposed along with that script's encoding.

From my conversation with the scholars currently present at my location, it would seem that one generic (i.e. non-script-specific) Sama Vedic svara marker is also required based on the attestations in Kannada and Tulu/Tigalari texts.
Nandinagari

The case of the (non-Sama-Vedic) svara markers shown for this script is the same as above – experts should review determine the requirement for encoding.

As regarding the Vedic anusvara, the form seen in the first two samples seems to be just a glyphic variant of form seen in the third sample as the shapes are similar and the linguistic context of both is the same. As such the two forms may be unified. Anshuman Pandey’s Nandinagari draft L2/13-002 already proposes the latter form for U+11D8D as Nandinagari Sign Candrabindu. However it seems Anshuman’s labeling this character as Candrabindu is based on Gruenendahl’s attestation of the same as “anunāsika” provided on p 21. However, neither Gruenendahl nor any other attestation Anshuman has given for Nandinagari actually shows the usage of this character unlike Srinidhi’s samples.

It is therefore most probable that this character is not the combining candrabindu cognate with U+0903 Devanagari Sign Candrabindu etc but in fact a Vedic Anusvara sign cognate with U+A8F2 or U+A8F3, especially since the first variant seen in the samples is identical in shape to U+A8F2. As such, Anshuman’s draft should be corrected to reflect this.

In this connection, I must note that Anshuman’s draft also mentions on p 4 (with attestations on p 21) the presence of some Vedic svara markers in Nandinagari, one of which is the Upturned U Below also seen in the Tulu/Tigalari samples from Srinidhi.

Grantha

The circle and U above identified by Srinidhi are not distinguishable from U+11366 and U+11368 which are the Combining Digits Zero and Two Above. While initially proposed for Sama Veda, they may be certainly used for any other Veda!

Further, while the sample from Saraju Rath does indeed provide instances of usage of U+11368 Combining Two Above for the udatta, the two samples above that one actually attest its usage for the svarita and not the udatta.

The first six samples provided for the Vedic anusvara merely attest a variant of U+1135E Grantha Sign Vedic Anusvara where the circle lies below the moon instead of within it. The last sample shows yet another variant with a circle both within and below the moon. The linguistic contexts are however identical in all the cases. Thus there is no requirement for separate encoding here.
Malayalam

A Malayalam sample for **COMBINING TWO ABOVE** is provided amidst the Grantha ones. Srinidhi identifies it as of the Rig Veda Pada Patha, but I wasn’t able to identify exactly where this section is, since each line seems to refer to a different part of the known Rig Veda. Nevertheless, the combining digit two above here does seem to denote the udatta.

However, given that the Malayalam digit two is obviously glyphically similar to that of Grantha, the character should be separately encoded for Malayalam if need be.

From my enquiries, it seems unlikely that other combining digits are found for Malayalam since the native Sama Vedic scholars of that region are all of the Jaiminiya school which does not use these combining marks but instead requires ruby text just as in Devanagari and Grantha.

Thus again, experts should determine whether it is important to encode this lone Malayalam-specific Vedic character.

Bengali

The provided sample gives attestation for **COMBINING ONE, TWO, THREE, KA, RA and AVAGRAHA ABOVE** corresponding to the Devanagari characters U+A8E1 etc in the Devanagari Extended block. Attestation for the rest of the combining characters for the Sama Veda is to be looked for in the Gana section of the Sama Veda. These characters may be proposed after collecting sufficient attestations.

Telugu

The text provided here provides attestation for both **COMBINING ONE, TWO, THREE and RA ABOVE**. It also shows a Candrabindu Virama identical in shape and purpose to the Devanagari character A8F3. Like in Bengali, these characters may also be proposed after collecting sufficient attestations.

-o-o-o-