ISO/TC 46
« Information and documentation »

Z41A

Date:
2017-05-15

Doc. Number:
N 2654

Assistant:
Filomena Vieira
Direct line : + 33 (0) 1 41 62 84 65
mariafilomena.araujovieira@afnor.org

Your contact:
Sabine Donnard Cusse
Direct line : + 33 (0)1 41 62 82 59
sabine.donnardcusse@afnor.org

Results on ISO CD 20674-1: Information and documentation - Transliteration of scripts in use in Thailand – Part 1: Transliteration of Akson-Thai-Noi

COMMENTS/
DECISIONS

Following the distribution of the CD project on

Information and documentation -- Transliteration of scripts in use in Thailand -- Part 1: Transliteration of Akson-Thai-Noi

document N2636 on the 16th March 2017,

please find below the results of the ballot on ISO CD 20674-1, closed on 2017-05-11.

FOLLOW UP

SOURCE

ISO/TC 46 Secretariat

Result of voting

Ballot Information

Ballot reference	ISO/CD 20674-1
Ballot type	CD
Ballot title	Information and documentation -- Transliteration of scripts in use in Thailand -- Part 1: Transliteration of Akson-Thai-Noi
Opening date	2017-03-16
Closing date	2017-05-11
Note	

Member responses:

Votes cast (38)

Armenia (SARM)
Australia (SA)
Belgium (NBN)
Bulgaria (BDS)
Canada (SCC)
China (SAC)
Croatia (HZN)
Denmark (DS)
Egypt (EOS)
Estonia (EVS)
Finland (SFS)
France (AFNOR)
Germany (DIN)
Greece (NQIS ELOT)
Iran, Islamic Republic of (ISIRI)
Ireland (NSAI)
Italy (UNI)
Japan (JISC)
Kenya (KEBS)
Korea, Republic of (KATS)
Latvia (LVS)
Malaysia (DSM)
Mauritania (DNPQ)
Morocco (IMANOR)
Netherlands (NEN)
Norway (SN)
Poland (PKN)
Portugal (IPQ)
Russian Federation (GOST R)
South Africa (SABS)
Spain (UNE)
Sweden (SIS)
Switzerland (SNV)
Thailand (TISI)
The Former Yugoslav Republic of Macedonia (ISRM)
Ukraine (DSTU)

	United Kingdom (BSI) United States (ANSI)
Comments submitted (3)	Austria (ASI) Ethiopia (ESA) Slovenia (SIST)

Votes not cast (0)

Questions:	
Q.1	"Do you approve the circulation of the draft as a DIS?"

Votes by members	Q.1
Armenia (SARM)	Abstention
Australia (SA)	Abstention
Belgium (NBN)	Abstention
Bulgaria (BDS)	Approval
Canada (SCC)	Disapproval
China (SAC)	Approval with comments
Croatia (HZN)	Abstention
Denmark (DS)	Approval
Egypt (EOS)	Approval
Estonia (EVS)	Approval
Finland (SFS)	Approval
France (AFNOR)	Abstention
Germany (DIN)	Abstention
Greece (NQIS ELOT)	Approval
Iran, Islamic Republic of (ISIRI)	Approval
Ireland (NSAI)	Abstention
Italy (UNI)	Approval
Japan (JISC)	Abstention
Kenya (KEBS)	Approval
Korea, Republic of (KATS)	Approval
Latvia (LVS)	Abstention
Malaysia (DSM)	Approval
Mauritania (DNPQ)	Approval
Morocco (IMANOR)	Abstention

Netherlands (NEN)	Abstention
Norway (SN)	Approval
Poland (PKN)	Abstention
Portugal (IPQ)	Abstention
Russian Federation (GOST R)	Approval
South Africa (SABS)	Abstention
Spain (UNE)	Abstention
Sweden (SIS)	Abstention
Switzerland (SNV)	Abstention
Thailand (TISI)	Approval
The Former Yugoslav Republic of Macedonia (ISRM)	Abstention
Ukraine (DSTU)	Approval
United Kingdom (BSI)	Abstention
United States (ANSI)	Approval with comments

Answers to Q.1: "Do you approve the circulation of the draft as a DIS?"		
16 x	**Approval**	**Bulgaria (BDS)** **Denmark (DS)** **Egypt (EOS)** **Estonia (EVS)** **Finland (SFS)** **Greece (NQIS ELOT)** **Iran, Islamic Republic of (ISIRI)** **Italy (UNI)** **Kenya (KEBS)** **Korea, Republic of (KATS)** **Malaysia (DSM)** **Mauritania (DNPQ)** **Norway (SN)** **Russian Federation (GOST R)** **Thailand (TISI)** **Ukraine (DSTU)**
2 x	**Approval with comments**	**China (SAC)** **United States (ANSI)**
1 x	**Disapproval**	**Canada (SCC)**
19 x	**Abstention**	**Armenia (SARM)** **Australia (SA)** **Belgium (NBN)** **Croatia (HZN)** **France (AFNOR)** **Germany (DIN)** **Ireland (NSAI)**

Japan (JISC)
Latvia (LVS)
Morocco (IMANOR)
Netherlands (NEN)
Poland (PKN)
Portugal (IPQ)
South Africa (SABS)
Spain (UNE)
Sweden (SIS)
Switzerland (SNV)
The Former Yugoslav Republic of Macedonia (ISRM)
United Kingdom (BSI)

Comments from Voters		
Member:	Comment:	Date:
Canada (SCC)	*Comment File*	2017-04-27 20:17:30
CommentFiles/ISO_CD 20674-1_SCC.doc		
China (SAC)	*Comment File*	2017-05-08 04:00:43
CommentFiles/ISO_CD 20674-1_SAC.doc		
United States (ANSI)	*Comment File*	2017-04-21 22:04:47
CommentFiles/ISO_CD 20674-1_ANSI.doc		

Comments from Commenters		
Member:	Comment:	Date:
Austria (ASI)	*Comment*	2017-03-31 12:32:39
Austria abstains		
Ethiopia (ESA)	*Comment*	2017-04-24 13:31:29
Abstention		
Slovenia (SIST)	*Comment*	2017-05-12 15:40:16
Approval		

MB/ NC[1]	Line number	Clause/ Subclause	Paragraph/ Figure/Table	Type of comment[2]	Comments	Proposed change	Observations of the secretariat
US 001				ed	I cannot comment on the substance but the text needs a thorough proof reading ("modem" for "modern" for instance). It is not clear to me that in complies with Directives Part 2 to put some definitions in normative annex A and others in clause 3, alongside numerous specifications of graphemes which are less definitions than a mapping table which ought to be in their own clause away from terminological definitions. The references in the Bibliography ought to find a way of making it clear that the "Royal Institute" referred to is the Thai Royal Institute rather than other similarly named organisations in other jurisdictions.		
US 002				ge	We are not qualified to express an opinion on this topic		
US 003				ge	I am not qualified to comment on this measure.		
US 004							
US 005							

1 **MB** = Member body / **NC** = National Committee (enter the ISO 3166 two-letter country code, e.g. CN for China; comments from the ISO/CS editing unit are identified by **)
2 **Type of comment:**   **ge** = general   **te** = technical   **ed** = editorial

MB/ NC[1]	Line number	Clause/ Subclause	Paragraph/ Figure/Table	Type of comment[2]	Comments	Proposed change	Observations of the secretariat
US 006							
SAC 007				ge	a) This draft gives every alphabet or marker in **Akson-Thai-Noi** a Romanized specific transliterating character, instead of merging it with other homophones. b) To differentiate different alphabets or markers which are pronounced the same in Thai Noi (but maybe not in other Thai dialects) in the transliteration is necessary for both researchers and other users, especially local scholars and outside visiters. c) The transliteration codes related to Standard Thai's makes it easily understanding. It makes it easy for who knowing other Thai writing systems.		
CA2 008		6, Annex C		Te	Section 6 Romanization Table lists the Akson-Thai-Noi character, its code position in 10646, the Romanized character (or sequence), the code position of the Romanized character (or sequence), and name of the character under the Comment column. For the code positions of 10646 there are several entries with an * next to them, referring to the note at the end of the table, which reads "* - These 20 code positions are provisionally assigned in this standard pending the outcome of the application to update ISO/IEC 10646 accordingly."	Since some of the glyphs and names for characters do not match between Section 6 and Annex C, perhaps a short explanation in the common column to include the 10646 name for the code point and a short explanation of any glyph difference should be added. A potential implementer, otherwise, will be looking for a glyph from col. 2, to be able to replace it with its Romanized version, and will not find it in a text with normal 10646 Thai encoding.	

1   **MB** = Member body / **NC** = National Committee (enter the ISO 3166 two-letter country code, e.g. CN for China; comments from the ISO/CS editing unit are identified by **)
2   **Type of comment:**   **ge** = general   **te** = technical   **ed** = editorial

MB/ NC[1]	Line number	Clause/ Subclause	Paragraph/ Figure/Table	Type of comment[2]	Comments	Proposed change	Observations of the secretariat
					Annex C (informative) shows the code chart that the characters and code positions the above note refers to. The glyphs for the characters shown in the columns of section 6 do not correspond to the glyphs shown in the chart in Annex C for several code positions. Nor do the names in the Comment Column correspond to the Names in Unicode / 10646 charts.		
CA3 009		6, Annex C		Ge	No contribution seems to have been made yet to either ISO/IEC JTC1/SC2 or to the Unicode Consortium regarding new characters and their proposed code positions in 10646/Unicode. The process of handling such a request in SC2 and Unicode can take up to 12 months to have an acceptable resolution and a few more months to be included in a published amendment (or next edition) of 10646. Given this time needed for synchronization with 10646, perhaps this CD ballot should be held back at least until SC2 has had a chance to look at the contribution and provide some feedback to TC46? Otherwise, the content of this CD will be technically unstable.	Clarify and allow time for synchronization with ISO/IEC JTC1/SC2 or the Unicode Consortium regarding new characters and their proposed code positions. This might require that this CD ballot is deferred. Otherwise its content will be technically unstable.	
CA4 010		Annex C		Ed	Annex C (informative) shows the code chart and is marked as Unicode code chart. It should be marked also as ISO/IEC 10646 code chart.	Add a reference to the current ISO/IEC 10646 (2014) standard in Annex C's heading.	

1 **MB** = Member body / **NC** = National Committee (enter the ISO 3166 two-letter country code, e.g. CN for China; comments from the ISO/CS editing unit are identified by **)
2 **Type of comment:**   **ge** = general   **te** = technical   **ed** = editorial

| | | | | | Date:2017-05-13 | Document: | | Project: |

Template for comments and secretariat observations

MB/ NC[1]	Line number	Clause/ Subclause	Paragraph/ Figure/Table	Type of comment[2]	Comments	Proposed change	Observations of the secretariat
CA1 011		Content		Ed	The table of contents at the top is incomplete. It has only sections 1, 2 and 3 before the Annexes. The text has more sections beyond 3.	Complete 'Contents'.	

D:\ISO\data\prod_iso_comment-collation\work\temp\ISO_CD 20674-1_ANSI.doc: Collation successful

D:\ISO\data\prod_iso_comment-collation\work\temp\ISO_CD 20674-1_SAC.doc: Collation successful

D:\ISO\data\prod_iso_comment-collation\work\temp\ISO_CD 20674-1_SCC.doc: Collation successful

Collation of files was successful. Number of collated files: 3

SELECTED   (number of files): 3

PASSED TEST   (number of files): 3

FAILED TEST   (number of files): 0

CCT - Version 4.0/2015

1   **MB** = Member body / **NC** = National Committee (enter the ISO 3166 two-letter country code, e.g. CN for China; comments from the ISO/CS editing unit are identified by **)
2   **Type of comment:**   **ge** = general   **te** = technical   **ed** = editorial