Date: 2019 Oct 4
To: UTC & CLDR

From: Apple Localization Engineering, transmitted/edited by Peter Edberg

Subj: Comments on proposed kMandarin changes per 3 UTC actions & documents

This document consolidates proposed changes to the Unihan kMandarin field per the following UTC actions (with associated CLDR bugs and UTC documents), and provides comments on the proposed changes from Apple Localization Engineering:

UTC action	CLDR bug	UTC document	UTC document link
151-A36a	CLDR-10251	L2/17-109	https://www.unicode.org/L2/L2017/17109-unihan-db-corr.pdf
		Some of the c	hanges in the above were also proposed by Persson in the following:
		L2/15-036R3	https://www.unicode.org/L2/L2015/15036r3-unified-readings.pdf
155-A40a	CLDR-11101	L2/18-117	https://www.unicode.org/review/pri361/feedback.html, see Mar 13 item
159-A47	CLDR-13144	L2/19-161	https://www.unicode.org/L2/L2019/19161-kmandarin-148.pdf

The Unihan kMandarin field is described in UAX #38 as follows:

- "The most customary pinyin reading for this character. When there are two values, then the first is preferred for zh-Hans (CN) and the second is preferred for zh-Hant (TW). When there is only one value, it is appropriate for both.
- "This field is targeted specifically for use by CLDR collation and transliteration. As such, it is subject to considerations that help keep pinyin-based Han collation (and its tailorings) and transliteration reasonably stable. The values may not in all cases track the preferred use in some dictionaries."

Additionally, the kMandarin field should match the expectations of users of CLDR/ICU Chinese collations and transliteration; in many cases this means matching the readings in dictionaries that such users are most likely to consult.

The Apple Localization Engineering team consulted the following online dictionaries for the feedback here:

- http://chardb.iis.sinica.edu.tw
- https://ctext.org/dictionary.pl?if=gb
- https://zidian.911cha.com

The attached spreadsheet consolidates input from the proposals listed at the top, and provides comments from Apple Localization Engineering. Suggested resolutions based on Apple comments:

- AGREE (170): use proposed value.
- COMBINE (3): use suggested value that combines proposed value (for CN) with current or other value (for TW).
- BOTH (27): current and proposed are both valid; keep current for stability.
- MULTIPLE including proposed (13): proposed and another value are both valid; use proposed.
- MULTIPLE including current (10): proposal removes reading, but current and another value are both valid;
 keep current.
- MULTIPLE, comment omits proposed or changes current (6): needs further study, keep current for now.
- DISAGREE (7): needs further study, **keep current** for now.

2019 Oct 4: Proposed kMandarin changes per 3 UTC actions & documents, with comments from Apple Loc. Eng.

character	code	kMandarin current; if two values, first is for CN/Hans, second for TW/Hant	kMandarin in proposal	proposal	Apple Loc. Eng. comments: AGREE with proposal (170); COMBINE proposed with current or other as CN/TW entries (3); BOTH—found references for both current & proposed, not a CN/TW difference (27); MULTIPLE—references suggest other multiple readings (29); DISAGREE with proposal (7).	corres- ponding traditional character (same readings apply)	corres- ponding traditional character code	corresponding traditional character kMandarin current
	U+3D0E		nài	17-109	AGREE			
煒	U+3E06		kào	19-161	AGREE			
草	U+44EC		zhuó	19-161	AGREE			
駁	U+4B78	bǎo	fù	17-109	AGREE			
婇	U+5A47	cāi	căi	17-109, also 15-036R3	AGREE			
悷	U+60B7	sàn	lì	17-109, also 15-036R3	AGREE			
樋	U+6A0B	tŏng	tōng	17-109, also 15-036R3	AGREE			
櫚	U+6ADA	lú	Ιΰ	17-109, also 15-036R3	AGREE			
珖	U+73D6	guàng	guāng	17-109, also 15-036R3	AGREE			
瞡	U+77A1	guĭ	guī	17-109, also 15-036R3	AGREE			
腜	U+815C	měi	méi	17-109, also 15-036R3	AGREE			
腬	U+816C	ròu	róu	17-109, also 15-036R3	AGREE			
膒	U+8192	óu	ōu	17-109, also 15-036R3	AGREE			
蒑	U+8491	yìn	yīn	17-109, also 15-036R3	AGREE			

訉	U+8A09	fān	fàn	17-109, also 15-036R3	AGREE		
吕区	U+90D8	lű	Iŭ	17-109, also 15-036R3	AGREE		
鴤	U+9D24	dōng	zhōng	17-109, also 15-036R3	AGREE		
蜀鳥	U+9E00	chů	shǔ	17-109, also 15-036R3	AGREE		
恵	U+20164		xí	19-161	AGREE		
	U+208E1	fèng		17-109	AGREE		
	U+21B15		lóng	17-109	AGREE		
	U+22741		hōng	17-109	AGREE		
	U+2588F		diàn	17-109	AGREE		
	U+2589F	hù		17-109	AGREE		
	U+258F9	ràn		17-109	AGREE		
	U+258FA		ràn	17-109	AGREE		
	U+25C1F	gǎn	yuán	17-109	AGREE		
肪	U+26676		gǔ	19-161	AGREE		
莂	U+26C21		nà	19-161	AGREE		
	U+272D5	kŭn	kùn	17-109	AGREE		
	U+2757A	shuàng	shuāng	17-109	AGREE		
	U+27956	lì	lí	17-109	AGREE		
	U+280A2	jì	jí	17-109	AGREE		
	U+2824B	tuó	tuō	17-109	AGREE		
	U+284A8	nài	hài	17-109	AGREE		
	U+287B3	qú		17-109	AGREE		

	U+28ABF		liú	17-109	AGREE			
	U+28DED	chǎn	chán	17-109	AGREE			
	U+293CF	wěi	wéi	17-109	AGREE			
	U+295F5	zhěng	zhēng	17-109	AGREE			
	U+29B5D	wō	wŏ	17-109	AGREE			
	U+2A008	yuān		17-109	AGREE			
蟉	U+2A917		liào	19-161	AGREE			
ШЩ	U+2AA30		qū	19-161	AGREE			
拳	U+2AA36		shē	19-161	AGREE	拳	U+8F0B	shē
巘	U+2AA58		yǎn	19-161	AGREE	巘	U+5DD8	yǎn
延	U+2B127		yán	19-161	AGREE	綖	U+7D96	yán
繶	U+2B137		yì	19-161	AGREE	繶	U+7E76	yì
艻	U+2B1ED		wěi	19-161	AGREE	艻	U+2B1ED	
调	U+2B363		tóng	19-161	AGREE	蒍	U+848D	wěi
诚	U+2B36F		xián	19-161	AGREE	詞	U+8AF4	xián
谖	U+2B37D		xuān	19-161	AGREE	譞	U+8B5E	xuān
鄅	U+2B461		méng	19-161	AGREE	鄳	U+9133	méng
銈	U+2B4EF		jī	19-161	AGREE	銈	U+9288	jī
铜	U+2B4F6		xuān	19-161	AGREE	鋗	U+92D7	xuān
铒	U+2B4F9		jī	19-161	AGREE	錤	U+9324	jī
番	U+2B50D		fán	19-161	AGREE	鐇	U+9407	fán
阒	U+2B536		niè	19-161	AGREE	関	U+95D1	niè

频	U+2B5AE	 yĭ	19-161	AGREE	顗	U+9857	yĭ
频	U+2B5AF	 fǔ	19-161	AGREE	頫	U+982B	fǔ
敦	U+2B61C	 wén	19-161	AGREE	퇐	U+99BC	wén
鸦	U+2B626	 táo	19-161	AGREE	騊	U+9A0A	táo
录	U+2B627	 lù	19-161	AGREE	騄	U+9A04	lù
獂	U+2B62A	 yuán	19-161	AGREE	馬原	U+9A35	yuán
螇	U+2B62C	 xí	19-161	AGREE	黟	U+9A31	xí
监	U+2B696	 cĭ	19-161	AGREE	鮆	U+9B86	cĭ
盤	U+2B6AD	 liè	19-161	AGREE	鱲	U+9C72	liè
鸳	U+2B6ED	 kuáng	19-161	AGREE	鵟	U+9D5F	kuáng
蹒	U+2B7A9	 mén	19-161	AGREE	璊	U+748A	mén
综	U+2B7C5	 liáng	19-161	AGREE	綡	U+7DA1	liáng
襚	U+2B7E6	 suì	19-161	AGREE	輚	U+4875	suì
鉝	U+2B7F7	 lì	19-161	AGREE	鉝	U+925D	lì
铁	U+2B7F9	 hóng	19-161	AGREE	鉷	U+9277	hóng
垯	U+2B7FC	 dá	19-161	AGREE	鐽	U+943D	dá
攰	U+2B806	 kuĭ	19-161	AGREE	頍	U+980D	kuĭ
骇	U+2B80A	 xuán	19-161	AGREE	馬玄	U+4B84	xuán
쎲	U+2B81C	 ní	19-161	AGREE	齒兒	U+9F6F	ní
侔	U+2B8B8	 dàn	19-161	AGREE	僤	U+50E4	dàn
垃	U+2BB5F	 ōu	19-161	AGREE	塸	U+5878	ōu

坨	U+2BB62	 lŭn	19-161	AGREE	埨	U+57E8	lŭn
捞	U+2BB7C	 láo	19-161	AGREE	?	U+2144D	láo
単	U+2BB83	 shàn	19-161	AGREE	墠	U+58A0	shàn
经	U+2BC1B	 xíng	19-161	AGREE	娙	U+5A19	xíng
坜	U+2BD77	 lì	19-161	AGREE	爏	U+3823	lì
駮	U+2BDF7	 xīn	19-161	AGREE	廞	U+5EDE	xīn
弦	U+2BE29	 kōu	19-161	AGREE	彄	U+5F44	kōu
時	U+2C029	 wěi	19-161	AGREE	暐	U+6690	wěi
砚	U+2C02A	 xiàn	19-161	AGREE	晛	U+665B	xiàn
挟	U+2C0A9	 jiā	19-161	AGREE	梜	U+689C	jiā
板	U+2C0CA	 zhì	19-161	AGREE	櫍	U+6ACD	zhì
沥	U+2C1D5	 wàn	19-161	AGREE	邁	U+6FAB	wàn
涸	U+2C1F9	 guó	19-161	AGREE	漍	U+6F0D	guó
煜	U+2C288	 xún	19-161	AGREE	燖	U+71D6	xún
拾	U+2C317	 hé	19-161	AGREE			
轹	U+2C35B	 lì	19-161	AGREE	瓅	U+74C5	lì
	U+2C361	 dàng	19-161	AGREE	盪	U+7497	dàng
玤	U+2C364	 xún	19-161	AGREE	璕	U+7495	xún
硝	U+2C494	 gěng	19-161	AGREE			
礎	U+2C497	 lán	19-161	AGREE	礸	U+255FD	
箦	U+2C542	 lŏng	19-161	AGREE	簣	U+7BE2	lŏng

纠	U+2C613	 xún	19-161	AGREE	紃	U+7D03	xún
统	U+2C618	 dǎn	19-161	AGREE	紞	U+7D1E	dǎn
纽	U+2C621	 yīn	19-161	AGREE	級	U+7D6A	yīn
纽	U+2C629	 tīng	19-161	AGREE	綎	U+7D8E	tīng
靖	U+2C62C	 qiàn	19-161	AGREE	精	U+7DAA	qiàn
绰	U+2C62F	 zhǔn	19-161	AGREE	綧	U+7DA7	zhǔn
缓	U+2C64A	 mò	19-161	AGREE	纆	U+7E86	mò
鑲	U+2C64B	 xiāng	19-161	AGREE	纕	U+7E95	rǎng
荷	U+2C72C	 màn	19-161	AGREE	蔄	U+8504	màn
满	U+2C72F	 liǎng	19-161	AGREE	荫	U+44E3	liǎng
蘋	U+2C79F	 pín	19-161	AGREE	蘋	U+860B	píng
詩	U+2C7C1	 yì	19-161	AGREE	幕	U+8649	yì
讶	U+2C8D9	 хū	19-161	AGREE	訏	U+8A0F	хū
	U+2C8DE	 zhǔ	19-161	AGREE	詝	U+8A5D	zhǔ
浅	U+2C8E1	 jiàn	19-161	AGREE	諓	U+8AD3	jiàn
退	U+2C8F3	 hěn	19-161	AGREE	詪	U+8A6A	hěn
湮	U+2C907	 yīn	19-161	AGREE	諲	U+8AF2	yīn
堤	U+2C90A	 shì	19-161	AGREE	諟	U+8ADF	shì
速	U+2C91D	 huì	19-161	AGREE	譓	U+8B53	huì
纸	U+2CA02	 qí	19-161	AGREE	軝	U+8EDD	qí
	U+2CA0E	 yóu	19-161	AGREE	輶	U+8F36	yóu

鄠	U+2CA7D	 xún	19-161	AGREE	鄩	U+9129	xún
酢	U+2CAA9	 nóng	19-161	AGREE	醴	U+91B2	nóng
锐	U+2CB29	 yì	19-161	AGREE	釴	U+91F4	yì
轮	U+2CB2D	 lún	19-161	AGREE	錀	U+9300	lún
长	U+2CB2E	 chẳng	19-161	AGREE	鋹	U+92F9	chǎng
锹	U+2CB38	 shù	19-161	AGREE	鉥	U+9265	shù
钟	U+2CB39	 shén	19-161	AGREE	鉮	U+926E	huán
护	U+2CB3B	 lú	19-161	AGREE	鑪	U+946A	lú
铝	U+2CB3F	 zhāo	19-161	AGREE	鉊	U+924A	zhāo
牳	U+2CB41	 mŭ	19-161	AGREE	鉧	U+9267	mů
钍	U+2CB4A	 dù	19-161	AGREE	釷	U+289C0	
锯	U+2CB4E	 hóng	19-161	AGREE	鋐	U+92D0	hóng
铍	U+2CB5B	 bō	19-161	AGREE	鉁	U+28A0F	
餱	U+2CB64	 hóu	19-161	AGREE	鍭	U+936D	hóu
铴	U+2CB69	 wēng	19-161	AGREE	鎰	U+9393	wēng
错	U+2CB6C	 huì	19-161	AGREE	鏏	U+93CF	wèi
锹	U+2CB6F	 piě	19-161	AGREE	鏅	U+4955	piě
譆	U+2CB73	 xĭ	19-161	AGREE	鍏	U+28B4E	
揺	U+2CB76	 hēi	19-161	AGREE	鎐	U+28B46	hēi
辚	U+2CB78	 lín	19-161	AGREE	鏻	U+93FB	lín
璲	U+2CB7C	 suì	19-161	AGREE	鐩	U+9429	suì

闽	U+2CBB1	 yīn	19-161	AGREE	闉	U+95C9	yīn
脐	U+2CBC0	 jī	19-161	AGREE	隮	U+96AE	īī
颇	U+2CC56	 dí	19-161	AGREE	頔	U+9814	dí
颜	U+2CC5F	 wěi	19-161	AGREE	頠	U+9820	wěi
马丕	U+2CCF5	 pī	19-161	AGREE	馬 <u>不</u>	U+99D3	рī
驷	U+2CCF6	 jiōng	19-161	AGREE	鴚	U+99C9	jiōng
珗	U+2CCFD	 shēn	19-161	AGREE	駪	U+99EA	shēn
骔	U+2CCFF	 tú	19-161	AGREE	駼	U+99FC	tú
骈	U+2CD02	 fēi	19-161	AGREE	騑	U+9A11	fēi
琚	U+2CD03	 huō	19-161	AGREE	騞	U+9A1E	huō
7.米 9.44	U+2CD0A	 lín	19-161	AGREE	驎	U+9A4E	lín
鮈	U+2CD8B	 jū	19-161	AGREE	鮈	U+9B88	jū
鲍	U+2CD8D	 tuó	19-161	AGREE	鮀	U+9B80	tuó
鮠	U+2CD8F	 wéi	19-161	AGREE	鮠	U+9BA0	wéi
鲱	U+2CD90	 zhào	19-161	AGREE	鮅	U+9BA1	zhào
鯻	U+2CD9F	 là	19-161	AGREE	鯻	U+9BFB	là
鰊	U+2CDA0	 liàn	19-161	AGREE	鰊	U+9C0A	liàn
既鱼	U+2CDA8	 jì	19-161	AGREE	既魚	U+9C40	jì
鰶	U+2CDAD	 jì	19-161	AGREE	鰶	U+9C36	jì
鱚	U+2CDAE	 xĭ	19-161	AGREE	鱚	U+9C5A	хĭ
鸥	U+2CE18	 yǎn	19-161	AGREE	夏 鳥	U+9DA0	yǎn

鹙	U+2CE1A		yuè	19-161	AGREE	鸑	U+9E11	yuè
跨	U+2CE26		zhuó	19-161	AGREE	驚	U+9DDF	zhuó
形	U+2CE2A		fán	19-161	AGREE	鷂	U+9DED	fán
龂介	U+2CE7C		xiè	19-161	AGREE	齒介	U+9F58	xiè
崎	U+2CE88		yĭ	19-161	AGREE	监奇	U+9F6E	yĭ
遊	U+2CE93		chǔ	19-161	AGREE	选林 岡定	U+9F7C	chǔ
缕	U+2A8FB		lóu	19-161	AGREE, no reference found but the reading seems correct (traditional equivalent has lŏu)	塿	U+587F	lŏu
讽	U+8BBD	fèng	fěng	18-117	COMBINE: fěng fèng	諷	U+8AF7	fěng fèng
识	U+8BC6	shì	shí	18-117	COMBINE: shí shì	識	U+8B58	shí shì
勣	U+2A7DD		jì	19-161	COMBINE: jì jī	勣	U+52E3	jī
懬	U+389C	kàng	kāng	17-109	вотн			
樺	U+417F	huáng	huá	17-109	вотн			
託	U+46BE	nín	rén	17-109	вотн			
魵	U+4B7B	fù	fēn	17-109	вотн			
鴒	U+4CC9	dàn	dōng	17-109	вотн			
腊	U+4D7B	gŭ	huì	17-109	вотн			
婏	U+5A4F	fàn	fù	17-109, also 15-036R3	вотн			
婤	U+5A64	chōu	zhōu	17-109, also 15-036R3	ВОТН			
孅	U+5B45	qiān	xiān	17-109, also 15-036R3	ВОТН			
湞	U+6E5E	chēng	zhēn	17-109, also 15-036R3	ВОТН			

潬	U+6F6C	shàn	tān	17-109, also 15-036R3	ВОТН			
璾	U+74BE	zī	jì	17-109, also 15-036R3	ВОТН			
埬	U+2141D	fù	fú	17-109	ВОТН			
親	U+21594	nuŏ	nuó	17-109	ВОТН			
酵	U+2199D	xiáo	xiāo	17-109	ВОТН			
	U+21B0D	lóng	mí	17-109	ВОТН			
	U+21B10	mí	yí	17-109	ВОТН			
	U+2243F	rŏng	răng	17-109	ВОТН			
	U+2273D	kuĭ	kuí	17-109	ВОТН			
	U+22A10	jī	jí	17-109	ВОТН			
	U+245ED	xiā	xià	17-109	ВОТН			
	U+24704	huài	huái	17-109	ВОТН			
	U+247AE	zhāi	zhài	17-109	ВОТН			
	U+24856	yān	yán	17-109	ВОТН			
	U+248B5	ài	lài	17-109	ВОТН			
	U+2546B	kǎn	kān	17-109	ВОТН			
	U+2588D	suì	hù	17-109	ВОТН			
					MULTIPLE including proposed:			
彯	U+5F6F	piǎo	piāo	17-109, also 15-036R3	MULTIPLE: piāo (proposed), piào			
旽	U+65FD	tùn	tūn	17-109, also 15-036R3	MULTIPLE: tūn (proposed), zhùn			
軥	U+282EE		hōng	17-109	MULTIPLE: hōng (proposed), chūn			
岬	U+2BD87		dié	19-161	MULTIPLE: dié (proposed, dì	嵽	U+5D7D	dié

烟	U+2C27C		ŏu	19-161	MULTIPLE: ŏu (proposed, ōu	熰	U+71B0	ōu
焯	U+2C2A4		chǎn	19-161	MULTIPLE: chăn (proposed, dăn	燀	U+71C0	chǎn
岩	U+2C488		què	19-161	MULTIPLE: què (proposed, hú	礐	U+7910	què
综	U+2C62B		huán	19-161	MULTIPLE: huán (proposed, huǎn	綄	U+7D84	huán
鏔	U+2C642		yǎn	19-161	MULTIPLE: yan (proposed, yin	縯	U+7E2F	yǎn
螏	U+2C7FD		dōng	19-161	MULTIPLE: dong (proposed, dong	蝀	U+8740	dōng
锌	U+2CB5A		chún	19-161	MULTIPLE: chún (proposed, duì	錞	U+931E	chún
隑	U+2CBBF		gài	19-161	MULTIPLE: gài (proposed, qí	隑	U+9691	gài
郙	U+2CDD5		bŭ	19-161	MULTIPLE: bǔ (proposed, bū	鵏	U+9D4F	bŭ
					MULTIPLE including current (no proposed)			
寢	U+21B13	yí		17-109	MULTIPLE: yí (current), qǐn			
焪	U+226D9	wǎn		17-109	MULTIPLE: wăn (current), qíong			
懰	U+2277B	hōng		17-109	MULTIPLE: hong (current), hu			
	U+258AE	huá		17-109	MULTIPLE: huá (current), qín			
	U+27977	rén		17-109	MULTIPLE: rén (current), qì			
	U+28301	hōng		17-109	MULTIPLE: hōng (current), kān			
	U+28718	méi		17-109	MULTIPLE: méi (current), yăn			
	U+28A95	liú		17-109	MULTIPLE: liú (current), yì			
	U+29888	fēn		17-109	MULTIPLE: fēn (current), bǎo			
	U+29FE5	qú		17-109	MULTIPLE: qú (current), mí			
					MULTIPLE, comment omits proposed or changes current			
詽	U+46C2	yāo		17-109	MULTIPLE: chí, chǐ			

瑄	U+249EB	jìn	jīn	17-109	MULTIPLE: jìn (current), duī; do not use jīn (proposed) - less common			
鰺	U+275C8	n	nú	17-109	MULTIPLE: n (current), nù; do not use nú (proposed)			
院	U+28E30	jù	jú	17-109	MULTIPLE: jù (current), jű; do not use jú (proposed)			
鴖	U+2A048	zhuàng	zhuāng	17-109	MULTIPLE: zhuàng (current), chūn; do not use zhuāng (proposed)			
鸠	U+2A249	zhuàng	zhuāng	17-109	MULTIPLE: zhuàng (current), chūn; do not use zhuāng (proposed)			
備	U+2031A	ròng	nòng	17-109	DISAGREE, only found references for current reading			
熔	U+22892	sù	sū	17-109	DISAGREE, keep current, found no references for proposed reading			
麇	U+2A2A2	shĭ	shí	17-109	DISAGREE, keep current, found no references for proposed reading			
郡	U+2B5B3		yūn	19-161	DISAGREE, suggest jūn	頵	U+9835	yūn
恶	U+2BAC7		è	19-161	DISAGREE, suggest ě	噁	U+5641	ě
狈	U+2C1D9		bèi	19-161	DISAGREE, suggest pèi	浿	U+6D7F	pèi
斩	U+2CB31		jīn	19-161	DISAGREE, suggest jīn	釿	U+91FF	jīn