Response to Comments on Lao Yamakkan

Vinodh Rajan vinodh@virtualvinodh.com

14 July 2021

Richard Wordingham shared his comments about Lao Yamakkan on the Unicore list and also to me privately.

From Unicore:

[...] As Thai pure killers wanchakan (U+0E4C THAI CHARACTER THANTHAKHAT) and yamakkan (U+0E4E THAI CHARACTER YAMAKKAN) appear to have a common origin, I wonder whether Lao YAMAKKAN should be disunified from U+0ECC. The proposal does not present evidence that they are different characters, but it certainly seems that U+0ECC is being used everywhere that the proposed YAMAKKAN is. [...]

Below are relevant parts of the discussions with him via email.

Vinodh R:

[...] At least one argument against unification would be contrastive use. Jayasaro Bhikkhu (in CC) would like to use the new encoded Yamakkan and the Lao cancellation sign while writing Pali (adopting an older Thai-Pali orthography).

สก์ยปุต์โต

ສກົຍປຸຕ໌ ໂຕ

He has already produced several documents borrowing the Thai Yamakkan in Lao. The right approach of course would be to use the newly-proposed character. [..]

Richard W:

[...] The image shows a very Thai-like cancellation mark. However, I've been seeing Lao cancellation marks that are more like elaborate tildes, so the glyphic argument is not as strong as it would seem from that example.

Am I to take it that you don't have an unchallengeable example of a Lao script contrast?

Feel free to publish these remarks of mine. [...]

Vinodh R:

[...] The following image seems to show parallel usage of both the Cancellation (sic) and the proposed Yamakkan (marked in red). [..]

(ເຊິ່ງບາຕ) ເປັນກັນນີ້ (ສິ່ງທິບຸຄຄົລເພິງທາ ຄົ້ ຄຫຼິ້ຫາຕໍ່ ແລະເພິ່ນປະກອບດ້ວຍທຸຕໍ່ຍາ-ກັນນອັພທ໌ນີ້ ບໍ່ເປັນສິ່ງສຳຄັນໃນວາຈກ ເພາະວ່າ ຖັກກິຣິຍາ່ສັພທ໌ເປັນສກັນນຣາຕຸ ເໝືອນ ຄຫົຫາຕໍ ນີ້ ກັບນອັພທ໌ນັບກໍນີ້ ຖັກກິຣິຍາອັພທ໌ ເວັ້ນ ອກັນນຣາຕຸ ກັນນອັພທ໌ນັ້ນກໍບໍ່ນີ້. ອຫຼືຫາຕໍ ເປັນກໍຮິຍາອາອັຍາຕ ກຫ ລາຕຸ ຫຫາ ບັຈຈັບ ຕໍ ວັຕຕນານາວິກັຕຕິ້ ບັຈຈຸບັນນກາລ ບຣັສສ-ນົທ ຈັກນູບຸຣູອ ເອກວຈນະ ກັດຕຸວາຈກ ກ່າວ ຜູ້ທຳ ຄົ້ນອກວ່າ ເປັນກິຣິຍາຂອງ ສາມເຫໂຮ (ເຊິ່ງເປັນຜູ້ຖືເອົາ)

Richard W:

[...] It looks then as though we'll have to handle another dimension to Lao script Pali writing systems. [...]

The image shown above is from [2] as referenced in L2/21-093. The Yamakkan is circled in red and the cancellation sign in blue.