

To: UTC (Unicode Technical Committee) Document Submissions

Author: Ben Denckla

Subject: UTC Doc: Errors in L2/14-056 about QAMATS QATAN

Date: 30 July 2025

[L2/14-056](#) (WG2 N4502) misunderstands Peter Constable’s discussion of HEBREW POINT QAMATS QATAN in his “Attachment 1” to [L2/05-259](#) (WG2 N2987). The misunderstanding appears in L2/14-056 listing QAMATS QATAN as one of the “additions [...] that have shown some particular difficulties for existing implementations).”

There were no such difficulties. The introduction and adoption (or non-adoption) of QAMATS QATAN over the last two decades is a success story, to be **contrasted** with ATNAH HAFUKH, rather than lumped in with ATNAH HAFUKH.

This error creates confusing documentation regarding the principles of disunification. I am not sure what means are customarily used to address such errors, but I imagine they might include a short erratum document and/or a new, corrected version of L2/14-056.

More fully, on page 31 of 48 of L2/14-056, in the section “F.5 Some additional guiding principles,” the following text appears:

The following additions to the standard at meeting M45 are some examples that have shown some particular difficulties for existing implementations (see document N2987 for more details).

- a. Addition of HEBREW POINT QAMATS QATAN
- b. Addition of HEBREW ACCENT ATNAH HAFUKH
- c. Addition of LATIN CAPITAL LETTER GLOTTAL STOP [...]

To conclude, I reiterate that the presence of list item “a” above is an error.