### Title
Final Disposition of comments on FPDAM 2 to ISO/IEC 14651:2001, Information technology -- International string ordering and comparison -- Method for comparing character strings and description of the common template tailorable ordering -- AMENDMENT 2

### Source
Mr. Alain LaBonte, Project Editor

### Project
JTC 1.02.14651.00.02

### Status
Disposition of comments agreed by Editing Group Meeting on 14651 held in Xiamen, Fujian Province, China, 2005-01-25.

### Action ID
FYI

### Due Date

### Distribution
P, O and L Members of ISO/IEC JTC 1/SC 2 ; ISO/IEC JTC 1 Secretariat; ISO/IEC ITTF

### Access Level
Def

### Issue No.
210

### File
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Name</th>
<th>Size (KB)</th>
<th>Pages</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>02n3782.pdf</td>
<td></td>
<td>23</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Telephone: +81-3-3431-2808; Facsimile: +81-3-3431-6493; E-mail: kimura@itscj.ipsj.or.jp
Disposition of comments

Comments (original comments [in gray] were copied from the PDF document received with the Acrobat copy function and therefore are unformatted)

Approvals with comments

USA

US 1.

The character repertoire for this amendment must stay stable with Unicode 4.0.

Accepted.
Disapprovals with comments

Germany

DE 1.

Vote:
-----------------------
Disapproval with comments. If the comments are satisfactorily resolved, the German vote will change to approval.

General comment
-----------------------
Please keep the tables as much upwards compatible as possible, both from their technical contents and from their naming conventions (the latter for ease of the stability of tailorings). Deviations from that rule should be reasoned for in accompanying documentation.

Change of name
-----------------------
Change of name <TONOS> --> <D030D>. Please keep the original name.

Not accepted. U+030D is not the Greek tonos, so changing the name from <TONOS> was an explicit correction.

DE 2.

Combining diacritics
-----------------------
The combining diacritics ligature left half, ligature right half, double tilde left half and double tilde right half used to be treated as second level weight in FPDAM 1. Now they are treated as ignorable on the first three levels. Please change back to the previous behaviour.

Not accepted. The changes are deliberate, because of the way these characters can only be used in certain combinations.

n lh g rh

where n and g are letters, and lh and rh are the left half and right half pieces of the diacritic. The right way to weight this is to give lh a weight as if it were a double diacritic, and then to ignore the rh. That is what is done in the table now.
DE 3.

Spurious first level weight assignments

A number of first level weight assignments are made, but seem never to be used. Please either remove these assignments or add a comment to the effect that they are never used. These include:

- `% GRAVE ACCENT`
- `% ACUTE ACCENT`
- `% SMALL TILDE`
- `% CIRCUMFLEX ACCENT`
- `% MACRON`
- `% OVERLINE`
- `% BREVE`
- `% DOT ABOVE`
- `% DIAERESIS`
- `% RING ABOVE`
- `% DOUBLE ACUTE ACCENT`
- `% GREEK PSILI`
- `% GREEK DASIA`
- `% CEDILLA`
- `% OGONEK`
- `% LOW LINE`
- `% DOUBLE LOW LINE`
- `% GREEK PERISPOMENI`
- `% KATAKANA-HIRAGANA VOICED SOUND MARK`
- `% KATAKANA-HIRAGANA SEMI-VOICED SOUND MARK`
- `% LEFT PARENTHESES UPPER HOOK`
- `% LEFT PARENTHESIS EXTENSION`
- `% RIGHT SQUARE BRACKET LOWER CORNER`
- `% LEFT CURLY BRACKET UPPER HOOK`
- `% LEFT CURLY BRACKET MIDDLE PIECE`
- `% LEFT CURLY BRACKET LOWER HOOK`
- `% CURLY BRACKET EXTENSION`

Accepted in principle. This was already the case in Amendment 1. A general comment will be added to say that some symbols are declared and assigned a weight while not necessarily used in the template, but can be used as hook-up (connection) symbols for creating the deltas.

DE 4.

Small capital letters

Small capital letters (e.g. `LATIN LETTER SMALL CAPITAL V`, `LATIN LETTER SMALL CAPITAL W`, `GREEK LETTER SMALL CAPITAL LAMDA`) should be treated as case variants of their corresponding basic letters (v, w
and lamda in these cases), not as letters with a separate weight. This
holds also true of letters such as LATIN LETTER SMALL CAPITAL B that
were already sorted in FPDAM 1.

Not accepted at this point. It would create a desynchronization between the UCA
and the current FPDAM. Furthermore, the Unicode experts say that these
characters are intended for phonological purposes that differ from the base letters.
A note in the FDAM will be added to explain this in general terms.

DE 5.

Modifier letters

Make modifier letters ignorable on the first three levels.

Partly accepted. The modification will be made (if there are cases subject to
modification, as none can be seen now) only for non-letterlike modifiers.

DE 6.

Cyrillic letters

Additions to the Cyrillic order should only done in synchronization
with GOST and their pan-Cyrillic ordering requirements. Until such
synchronization has been achieved, no additional Cyrillic letters
should be added.

Not accepted without more specific reference. So far the additions do not seem
problematical.

DE 7.

Number signs

Remove spurious weight assignments. Some numbers such as the Aegean
numbers have reserved first-level weights which are never used because
the numbers themselves are declared ignorable on the first three
levels.

Not accepted. See disposition of comment DE 3.

DE 8.

Various symbols
Ensure that the following symbols ignorable on the first three levels (all of them seem to be that already, in this case please remove or mark the spurious weight assignments).

<S239D> % LEFT PARENTHESIS LOWER HOOK
<S239E> % RIGHT PARENTHESIS UPPER HOOK
<S239F> % RIGHT PARENTHESIS EXTENSION
<S23A0> % RIGHT PARENTHESIS LOWER HOOK
<S23A1> % LEFT SQUARE BRACKET UPPER CORNER
<S23A2> % LEFT SQUARE BRACKET EXTENSION
<S23A3> % LEFT SQUARE BRACKET LOWER CORNER
<S23A4> % RIGHT SQUARE BRACKET UPPER CORNER
<S23A5> % RIGHT SQUARE BRACKET EXTENSION
<S23A6> % RIGHT SQUARE BRACKET LOWER CORNER
<S23A7> % LEFT CURLY BRACKET UPPER HOOK
<S23A8> % LEFT CURLY BRACKET MIDDLE PIECE
<S23A9> % LEFT CURLY BRACKET LOWER HOOK
<S23AA> % CURLY BRACKET EXTENSION
<S23AB> % RIGHT CURLY BRACKET UPPER HOOK
<S23AC> % RIGHT CURLY BRACKET MIDDLE PIECE
<S23AD> % RIGHT CURLY BRACKET LOWER HOOK
<S23AE> % INTEGRAL EXTENSION
<S23AF> % HORIZONTAL LINE EXTENSION
<S23B0> % UPPER LEFT OR LOWER RIGHT CURLY BRACKET SECTION
<S23B1> % UPPER RIGHT OR LOWER LEFT CURLY BRACKET SECTION
<S23B2> % SUMMATION TOP
<S23B3> % SUMMATION BOTTOM
<S23B4> % TOP SQUARE BRACKET
<S23B5> % BOTTOM SQUARE BRACKET
<S23B6> % BOTTOM SQUARE BRACKET OVER TOP SQUARE BRACKET
<S23B7> % RADICAL SYMBOL BOTTOM
<S23B8> % LEFT VERTICAL BOX LINE
<S23B9> % RIGHT VERTICAL BOX LINE
<S23BA> % HORIZONTAL SCAN LINE-1
<S23BB> % HORIZONTAL SCAN LINE-3
<S23BC> % HORIZONTAL SCAN LINE-7
<S23BD> % HORIZONTAL SCAN LINE-9
<S23BE> % DENTISTRY SYMBOL LIGHT VERTICAL AND TOP RIGHT
<S23BF> % DENTISTRY SYMBOL LIGHT VERTICAL AND BOTTOM RIGHT
<S23C0> % DENTISTRY SYMBOL LIGHT VERTICAL WITH CIRCLE
<S23C1> % DENTISTRY SYMBOL LIGHT DOWN AND HORIZONTAL WITH CIRCLE
<S23C2> % DENTISTRY SYMBOL LIGHT UP AND HORIZONTAL WITH CIRCLE
<S23C3> % DENTISTRY SYMBOL LIGHT VERTICAL WITH TRIANGLE
<S23C4> % DENTISTRY SYMBOL LIGHT DOWN AND HORIZONTAL WITH TRIANGLE
<S23C5> % DENTISTRY SYMBOL LIGHT UP AND HORIZONTAL WITH TRIANGLE
<S23C6> % DENTISTRY SYMBOL LIGHT VERTICAL AND WAVE
<S23C7> % DENTISTRY SYMBOL LIGHT DOWN AND HORIZONTAL WITH WAVE
<S23C8> % DENTISTRY SYMBOL LIGHT UP AND HORIZONTAL WITH WAVE
<S23C9> % DENTISTRY SYMBOL LIGHT DOWN AND HORIZONTAL
<S23CA> % DENTISTRY SYMBOL LIGHT UP AND HORIZONTAL
<S23CB> % DENTISTRY SYMBOL LIGHT VERTICAL AND TOP LEFT
<S2962> % LEFTWARDS HARPOON WITH BARB UP ABOVE LEFTWARDS HARPOON WITH BARB DOWN
<S2963> % UPWARDS HARPOON WITH BARB LEFT BESIDE UPWARDS HARPOON WITH BARB RIGHT
<S2964> % RIGHTWARDS HARPOON WITH BARB UP ABOVE RIGHTWARDS HARPOON WITH BARB DOWN
<S2965> % DOWNWARDS HARPOON WITH BARB LEFT BESIDE DOWNWARDS HARPOON WITH BARB RIGHT
<S2966> % LEFTWARDS HARPOON WITH BARB UP ABOVE RIGHTWARDS HARPOON WITH BARB UP
<S2967> % LEFTWARDS HARPOON WITH BARB DOWN ABOVE RIGHTWARDS HARPOON WITH BARB DOWN
<S2968> % RIGHTWARDS HARPOON WITH BARB UP ABOVE LEFTWARDS HARPOON WITH BARB UP
<S2969> % RIGHTWARDS HARPOON WITH BARB DOWN ABOVE LEFTWARDS HARPOON WITH BARB DOWN
<S296A> % LEFTWARDS HARPOON WITH BARB UP ABOVE LONG DASH
<S296B> % LEFTWARDS HARPOON WITH BARB DOWN BELOW LONG DASH
<S296C> % RIGHTWARDS HARPOON WITH BARB UP ABOVE LONG DASH
<S296D> % RIGHTWARDS HARPOON WITH BARB DOWN BELOW LONG DASH
<S296E> % UPWARDS HARPOON WITH BARB LEFT BESIDE DOWNWARDS HARPOON WITH BARB RIGHT
<S296F> % DOWNWARDS HARPOON WITH BARB LEFT BESIDE UPWARDS HARPOON WITH BARB RIGHT
<S2970> % RIGHT DOUBLE ARROW WITH ROUNDED HEAD
<S2971> % EQUALS SIGN ABOVE RIGHTWARDS ARROW
<S2972> % TILDE OPERATOR ABOVE RIGHTWARDS ARROW
<S2973> % LEFTWARDS ARROW ABOVE TILDE OPERATOR
<S2974> % RIGHTWARDS ARROW ABOVE TILDE OPERATOR
<S2975> % RIGHTWARDS ARROW ABOVE ALMOST EQUAL TO
<S2976> % LESS-TAN ABOVE LEFTWARDS ARROW
<S2977> % LEFTWARDS ARROW THROUGH LESS-TAN
<S2978> % GREATER-TAN ABOVE RIGHTWARDS ARROW
<S2979> % SUBSET ABOVE RIGHTWARDS ARROW
<S297A> % LEFTWARDS ARROW THROUGH SUBSET
<S297B> % SUPERSET ABOVE LEFTWARDS ARROW
<S297C> % LEFT FISH TAIL
<S297D> % RIGHT FISH TAIL
<S297E> % UP FISH TAIL
<S297F> % DOWN FISH TAIL
<S2980> % TRIPLE VERTICAL BAR DELIMITER
<S2981> % Z NOTATION SPOT
<S2982> % Z NOTATION TYPE COLON
<S2999> % DOTTED FENCE
<S299A> % VERTICAL ZIGZAG LINE
<S299B> % MEASURED ANGLE OPENING LEFT
<S299C> % RIGHT ANGLE VARIANT WITH SQUARE
<S299D> % MEASURED RIGHT ANGLE WITH DOT
<S299E> % ANGLE WITH S INSIDE
<S299F> % ACUTE ANGLE
<S29A0> % SPHERICAL ANGLE OPENING LEFT
<S29A1> % SPHERICAL ANGLE OPENING UP
<S29A2> % TURNED ANGLE
% EQUALS SIGN ABOVE PLUS SIGN
% PLUS SIGN ABOVE EQUALS SIGN
% EQUALS SIGN ABOVE TILDE OPERATOR
% EQUALS SIGN WITH TWO DOTS ABOVE AND TWO DOTS BELOW
% EQUIVALENT WITH FOUR DOTS ABOVE
% LESS-THAN WITH CIRCLE INSIDE
% GREATER-THAN WITH CIRCLE INSIDE
% LESS-THAN WITH QUESTION MARK ABOVE
% GREATER-THAN WITH QUESTION MARK ABOVE
% LESS-THAN OR SLANTED EQUAL TO
% GREATER-THAN OR SLANTED EQUAL TO
% LESS-THAN OR SLANTED EQUAL TO WITH DOT INSIDE
% GREATER-THAN OR SLANTED EQUAL TO WITH DOT INSIDE
% LESS-THAN OR SLANTED EQUAL TO WITH DOT ABOVE
% GREATER-THAN OR SLANTED EQUAL TO WITH DOT ABOVE
% LESS-THAN OR SLANTED EQUAL TO WITH DOT ABOVE RIGHT
% GREATER-THAN OR SLANTED EQUAL TO WITH DOT ABOVE LEFT
% LESS-THAN OR APPROXIMATE
% GREATER-THAN OR APPROXIMATE
% LESSTHAN AND SINGLE-LINE NOT EQUAL TO
% GREATERTHAN AND SINGLE-LINE NOT EQUAL TO
% LESS-THAN AND NOT APPROXIMATE
% GREATER-THAN AND NOT APPROXIMATE
% LESS-THAN ABOVE DOUBLE-LINE EQUAL ABOVE GREATER-THAN
% GREATER-THAN ABOVE DOUBLE-LINE EQUAL ABOVE LESS-THAN
% LESS-THAN ABOVE SIMILAR OR EQUAL
% GREATER-THAN ABOVE SIMILAR OR EQUAL
% LESS-THAN ABOVE SIMILAR ABOVE GREATER-THAN
% GREATER-THAN ABOVE SIMILAR ABOVE LESS-THAN
% LESS-THAN ABOVE GREATER-THAN ABOVE DOUBLE-LINE EQUAL
% GREATER-THAN ABOVE LESS-THAN ABOVE DOUBLE-LINE EQUAL
% LESS-THAN ABOVE SLANTED EQUAL ABOVE GREATER-THAN
% GREATER-THAN ABOVE SLANTED EQUAL ABOVE LESS-THAN
% LESS-THAN ABOVE DOUBLE-LINE EQUAL ABOVE GREATER-THAN
% GREATER-THAN ABOVE DOUBLE-LINE EQUAL ABOVE LESS-THAN
% LESS-THAN ABOVE SLANTED EQUAL TO OR LESS-THAN
% GREATER-THAN ABOVE SLANTED EQUAL TO OR GREATER-THAN
% SLANTED EQUAL TO OR LESS-THAN
% SLANTED EQUAL TO OR GREATER-THAN
% SLANTED EQUAL TO OR LESS-THAN WITH DOT INSIDE
% SLANTED EQUAL TO OR GREATER-THAN WITH DOT INSIDE
% DOUBLE-LINE EQUAL TO OR LESS-THAN
% DOUBLE-LINE EQUAL TO OR GREATER-THAN
% DOUBLE-LINE SLANTED EQUAL TO OR LESS-THAN
% DOUBLE-LINE SLANTED EQUAL TO OR GREATER-THAN
% SIMILAR OR LESS-THAN
% SIMILAR OR GREATER-THAN
% SIMILAR ABOVE LESS-THAN ABOVE EQUALS SIGN
% SIMILAR ABOVE GREATER-THAN ABOVE EQUALS SIGN
% DOUBLE NESTED LESS-THAN
% DOUBLE NESTED GREATER-THAN
% DOUBLE NESTED LESS-THAN WITH UNDERBAR
% GREATER-THAN OVERLAPPING LESS-THAN
% GREATER-THAN BESIDE LESS-THAN
% LESS-THAN CLOSED BY CURVE
<S268E> % DIGRAM FOR LESSER YANG
<S268F> % DIGRAM FOR GREATER YIN
<S2630> % TRIGRAM FOR HEAVEN
<S2631> % TRIGRAM FOR LAKE
<S2632> % TRIGRAM FOR FIRE
<S2633> % TRIGRAM FOR THUNDER
<S2634> % TRIGRAM FOR WIND
<S2635> % TRIGRAM FOR WATER
<S2636> % TRIGRAM FOR MOUNTAIN
<S2637> % TRIGRAM FOR EARTH
<S4DC0> % HEXAGRAM FOR THE CREATIVE HEAVEN
<S4DC1> % HEXAGRAM FOR THE RECEPTIVE EARTH
<S4DC2> % HEXAGRAM FOR DIFFICULTY AT THE BEGINNING
<S4DC3> % HEXAGRAM FOR YOUTHFUL FOLLY
<S4DC4> % HEXAGRAM FOR WAITING
<S4DC5> % HEXAGRAM FOR CONFLICT
<S4DC6> % HEXAGRAM FOR THE ARMY
<S4DC7> % HEXAGRAM FOR HOLDING TOGETHER
<S4DC8> % HEXAGRAM FOR SMALL TAMING
<S4DC9> % HEXAGRAM FOR TREADING
<S4DCA> % HEXAGRAM FOR PEACE
<S4DCB> % HEXAGRAM FOR STANDSTALL
<S4DCC> % HEXAGRAM FOR FELLOWSHIP
<S4DCE> % HEXAGRAM FOR GREAT POSSESSION
<S4DCE> % HEXAGRAM FOR MODESTY
<S4DCF> % HEXAGRAM FOR ENTHUSIASM
<S4DD0> % HEXAGRAM FOR FOLLOWING
<S4DD1> % HEXAGRAM FOR WORK ON THE DECAYED
<S4DD2> % HEXAGRAM FOR APPROACH
<S4DD3> % HEXAGRAM FOR CONTEMPLATION
<S4DD4> % HEXAGRAM FOR BITING THROUGH
<S4DD5> % HEXAGRAM FOR GRACE
<S4DD6> % HEXAGRAM FOR SPLITTING APART
<S4DD7> % HEXAGRAM FOR RETURN
<S4DD8> % HEXAGRAM FOR INNOCENCE
<S4DD9> % HEXAGRAM FOR GREAT TAMING
<S4DDA> % HEXAGRAM FOR MOUTH CORNERS
<S4DDB> % HEXAGRAM FOR GREAT PREPONDERANCE
<S4DDC> % HEXAGRAM FOR THE ABYSMAL WATER
<S4DDD> % HEXAGRAM FOR THE CLINGING FIRE
<S4DDE> % HEXAGRAM FOR INFLUENCE
<S4DDF> % HEXAGRAM FOR DURATION
<S4DE0> % HEXAGRAM FOR RETREAT
<S4DE1> % HEXAGRAM FOR GREAT POWER
<S4DE2> % HEXAGRAM FOR PROGRESS
<S4DE3> % HEXAGRAM FOR DARKENING OF THE LIGHT
<S4DE4> % HEXAGRAM FOR THE FAMILY
<S4DE5> % HEXAGRAM FOR OPPOSITION
<S4DE6> % HEXAGRAM FOR OBSTRUCTION
<S4DE7> % HEXAGRAM FOR DELIVERANCE
<S4DE8> % HEXAGRAM FOR DECREASE
<S4DE9> % HEXAGRAM FOR INCREASE
<S4DEA> % HEXAGRAM FOR BREAKTHROUGH
D320> % TETRAGRAM FOR DUTIES
D321> % TETRAGRAM FOR CHANGE
D322> % TETRAGRAM FOR DECISIVENESS
D323> % TETRAGRAM FOR BOLD RESOLUTION
D324> % TETRAGRAM FOR PACKING
D325> % TETRAGRAM FOR LEGION
D326> % TETRAGRAM FOR CLOSENESS
D327> % TETRAGRAM FOR KINSHIP
D328> % TETRAGRAM FOR GATHERING
D329> % TETRAGRAM FOR STRENGTH
D330> % TETRAGRAM FOR LEGION
D331> % TETRAGRAM FOR RESIDENCE
D332> % TETRAGRAM FOR LAW OR MODEL
D333> % TETRAGRAM FOR DOUBLE
D334> % TETRAGRAM FOR GREATNESS
D335> % TETRAGRAM FOR ENLARGEMENT
D336> % TETRAGRAM FOR PATTERN
D337> % TETRAGRAM FOR FLIGHT
D338> % TETRAGRAM FOR VASTNESS OR WASTING
D339> % TETRAGRAM FOR CONSTANCY
D340> % TETRAGRAM FOR ETERNITY
D341> % TETRAGRAM FOR UNIVERSE
D342> % TETRAGRAM FOR DIMINISHMENT
D343> % TETRAGRAM FOR CLOSED MOUTH
D344> % TETRAGRAM FOR AGGRAVATION
D345> % TETRAGRAM FOR COMPLIANCE
D346> % TETRAGRAM FOR ON THE VERGE
D347> % TETRAGRAM FOR DIFFICULTIES
Partly accepted. They will be made ignorable at the first three levels. However for the suggestion to remove unused symbols, see disposition of comment DE 3.
Korea

KR 1.

Summary: Some problems with the current CTT (Common Template Table) of ISO/IEC 14651 RE Hangeul

1. Five categories of Hangeul letters/syllables in UCS

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Category</th>
<th>Code Range</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1) Hangeul IPF-Johab letters</td>
<td>U+1100 - U+F1FF</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2) Hangeul Wanseong syllables</td>
<td>U+AC00 - U+D7A3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3) Hangeul Compatibility CV-Johab letters</td>
<td>U+3131 - U+318E</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4) Hangeul Half-width CV-Johab letters</td>
<td>U+FF00 - U+FFDC</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5) Hangeul Enclosed (Parenthesized)</td>
<td>U+3200-32C, U+3260-327B</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

* IPF=initial-peak-final, CV=consonant-vowel

2. Problems with the current CTT of ISO/IEC 14651 RE Hangeul

Comment withdrew this comment and changed its ballot to YES.

ISO (ITTF)

ISO 1.

Cover – editorial comment – The words "International Standard" should be replaced with "Amendment" until publication stage. The words "Final Proposed Draft Amendment 2" should be deleted.

Accepted. The FDAM will show these modifications.

*********** End of this disposition of comments ***********