Title: A Quick Response to WG2n3705: Comments and Questions on N 3598 (Nushu)

Source: China

Action: FYI

References: WG2n3598, WG2n3705

Comment/Question 1:
Please show an explanation for the table in p.7 below. (We find this table also in N3426, but also no explanation is there.)

i. We could not find the author of each column.

ii. In the document, the number after each script is explained to be a frequency of it, but some of the numbers seem to be miscalculated.

Response:
The author’s names will be added, the data of frequency will be checked.

Comment/Question 2:
The table is difficult for readers to understand. The difficulty comes from the fact that in this document, the number and the name of each script and the script itself are in split tables. Thus it is difficult for readers to connect them. They should be displayed in the same line.

Response:
The table will be reset for easy review.

Comment/Question 3:
The order of scripts seems to be arranged by the amount of strokes. But the criteria for counting the amount of strokes are not trustworthy. When the stroke is bent, the amount of the stroke is counted as two in the most of cases, but some of them seem to be counted as one. Examples are: .... ...

Response:
All stroke counts will be checked.
Comment/Question 4:
The caption of the picture of this coin says that "Coins with graphs in the period of Taipingtianguo", but these two rubbings in the picture are those of the recto and the verso of the same coin, not those of two coins. And we could not assert that this coin was made in Taipintianguo. See below.

Response:
Yes, these are two rubbings of one coin. “Coins” was a mistake made in translating WG2n3598 to English. Having investigated the original place of Nushu and studied lots of historical materials, the author of WG2n3598 (Prof. Zhao Liming, Tsinghua University) thought that the coin should been made in Taiping Tianguo (太平天国). A detailed discussion will be provided later.

Comment/Question 5:
The document asserts that the coin was made in the “Taipintianguo" period and the expert in Palace is referred to as a source of this assertion. Please show what is the palace and who is the expert in this document. Zhang Tie Bao (张铁宝), who is an expert of Taipintianguo, now a researcher of Taipintianguo museum in Nanjing, asserts that the coin should not be made in the Taipintianguo period. Please refer his book『女书的历史与现状--解析女书的新视点』"The History and Status Quo of Chinese Women's Script" pp.117-126 published in 2005 by 中国社会科学出版社.

Response:
“Expert in palace” in WG2n3598 should be “expert in Nanjing Museum”. Mr. Zhang Tiebao (张铁宝), a Taiping Tianguo history reasercher, confirmed to the author of WG2n3598 in 1998 that the coin was conform to the Taiping Tianguo money system. A detailed discussion will be provided later.

Comment/Question 6:
N3635 says that yin 「英」is not listed in the code chart because the script is not an original one but a modern one. According to the proposer Zhao Li Ming （赵丽明）, The origin of Nüshu script is Hanzi. Then if we distinguish original and modern Nüshu scripts according to the period in which the scripts were created from Hanzi, we should investigate when the each Nüshu script was created. But such investigation seems to be impossible. If a Nüshu scripts frequently used by 高银仙 (Gao Yin Xian) or 义年华 (Yi Nian Hua) are not categorized as original ones, many of Nüshu scripts are excluded from the code chart as modern ones.
The proposer selected the most frequent allograph as a basic script and the frequency of the script yin 「英」is about seven times as frequent as that of the “original” script in the third column from the left in the table of p.3 of N3449. In the table, the frequency of the former script is 96, and that of the latter one is 14. When the script yin 「英」is excluded from the code chart as a modern script, the proposer’s method that the most frequent allograph is selected as a basic script is
not applied to the script yin 「英」and there seems to be a double standard.

Response:
This is being carefully considered.

Note 1:
A revised proposal on Nushu (Nyushu) will be prepared with consideration of comments in "WG2n3705" and comments in other documents.

Note 2:
A detailed discussion on whether or not the coin was made in Taiping Tianguo will be provided later.