

ISO/IEC JTC1/SC2/WG2
Coded Character Set
Secretariat: Japan (JISC)

Doc. Type: Disposition of comments

Title: Disposition of comments on DAM1 text to ISO/IEC 10646 5th edition

Source: Michel Suignard (project editor)

Project: JTC1 02.10646.00.01.00.05

Status: For review by WG2

Date: 2018-06-18

Distribution: WG2

Reference: SC2 N4350 WG2 N4611

Medium: Paper, PDF file

Comments were received from Japan, UK, US, and ISO/CS editing unit. The following document is the draft disposition of those comments.

Note – With some minor exceptions, the full content of the ballot comments have been included in this document to facilitate the reading. The dispositions are inserted in between these comments and are marked in **Underlined Bold Serif text**, with explanatory text in italicized serif.

Although some comments were technical, they only concern minor name changes, so it is expected that the acceptance of these changes will maintain the result as approved unanimously.

Summary of name changes:

10F45	SOGDIAN PHONOGRAM SHIN	→ SOGDIAN INDEPENDENT SHIN
10D1D	HANIFI ROHINGYA VOWEL MARK A	→ HANIFI ROHINGYA VOWEL A
10D1E	HANIFI ROHINGYA VOWEL MARK I	→ HANIFI ROHINGYA VOWEL I
10D1F	HANIFI ROHINGYA VOWEL MARK U	→ HANIFI ROHINGYA VOWEL U
10D20	HANIFI ROHINGYA VOWEL MARK E	→ HANIFI ROHINGYA VOWEL E
10D21	HANIFI ROHINGYA VOWEL MARK O	→ HANIFI ROHINGYA VOWEL O
10D23	HANIFI ROHINGYA NA KHANNA	→ HANIFI ROHINGYA NA KHONNA
10F58	SOGDIAN PUNCTUATION CIRCLES WITH DOTS	→ SOGDIAN PUNCTUATION TWO CIRCLES WITH DOTS

Japan: Positive with comments

Editorial comment

E1. Page 4 (Page 2623 of the standard), Annex A.4.6 375 JAPANESE CORE KANJI

“J0 J source” in 2nd statement “All but four of these ideographs are identified by a J0 J source.” is redundant.

Proposed change by Japan

Please change this statement to “All but four of these ideographs are identified by a J0 source.”.

Accepted

UK: Positive with comments

Comments (Tx for technical, Ex for Editorial)

E1. Clause 33, Code Charts and list of character names – Chess Symbols

1FA67 XIANGQI BLACK GENERAL

Alias hēi jiāng should be hēi jiāng.

Proposed change by U.K.

Change alias hēi jiāng to hēi jiāng.

Accepted in principle

The new annotation is in fact expected to be:

= hēi jiàng

E2. Clause 33, Code Charts and list of character names – Kannada

0C84 KANNADA SIGN SIDDHAM

Missing a space character between A8FC and "devanagari sign siddham" in the cross reference.

Proposed change by U.K.

Add a space before "devanagari sign siddham" in the cross reference.

Accepted in principle

The cross references are autogenerated, based on code points, representative glyphs, and character names.

E3. Clause 33, Code Charts and list of character names – Miscellaneous Symbols and Pictographs

1F3B1 BILLIARDS

The glyph should be changed back to the previous form, as already agreed for PDAM 2 ballot disposition of comments.

Proposed change by U.K.

Revert to previous glyph.

Accepted

E4. Clause 33, Code Charts and list of character names – Mongolian

Some glyphs for Mongolian positional variants are rendered as question mark in a rectangular box, e.g. 1829 first form. This affects both the code chart list of characters and the following "Contextual Variants and Standardized Variation Sequences" section.

Proposed change by U.K.

Apply the correct font to all Mongolian positional forms.

Not accepted

The rendering using rectangular box is intentional. The preamble for the Mongolian letters contains the following text:

Letters unspecified for distinct positional forms are shown without them. Letters with unspecified positional forms use a squared question mark to indicate the gap. All vowels are expected to have explicit isolate forms. For consonants the isolate first form is the initial first form unless specified otherwise.

All positional forms (not variants) rendered with the question marks are not currently specified in Mongolian. When/if these positional forms become specified, appropriate glyphs will be used. These unspecified positional forms do not occur in normal Mongolian text.

E5. Clause 33, Code Charts and list of character names – Old Sogdian

10F12, 10F13, 10F27: "represents the Aramaic heterogram 'D'".

The character before D should be U+02BF MODIFIER LETTER LEFT HALF RING (see L2/16-312).

Proposed change by U.K.

Change the apostrophe before D to U+02BF MODIFIER LETTER LEFT HALF RING.

Accepted

Note that the use of code points in text compatible the annotation font style is limited to the range 0000-02FF.

T6. Clause 33, Code Charts and list of character names – Sogdian

10F45 SOGDIAN PHONOGRAM SHIN

The name is incorrect as this character is not a phonogram.

Proposed change by U.K.

Change name of U+10F45 to a more appropriate name.

Accepted in principle

See comment T4 from US and its disposition.

The name is changed to SOGDIAN INDEPENDENT SHIN.

USA: Positive with comments

Technical comments

T1. Clause 33, Code Charts and list of character names – Hanifi Rohingya

The USNB requests the word "MARK" in the names of the HANIFI ROHINGYA characters located in the range U+10D1D..U+10D21 be removed, so that the names are "HANIFI ROHINGYA VOWEL [xxx]." Names with "VOWEL MARK" are very rare; names with "VOWEL" are more consistent with other names in the UCS. The USNB does not support a change of VOWEL A to VOWEL AA.

Proposed change by U.S.A.

Remove "MARK" from the names of the Hanifi Rohingya characters in the range U+10D1D..U+10D21.

Accepted

Note that another name discrepancy was found in the original proposal:

<https://unicode.org/wg2/docs/n4813-hanifi-rohingya.pdf>

The name for 10D23 was HANIFI ROHINGYA NA KHANNA in the proposed code chart (page 2) but was named HANIFI ROHINGYA NA KHONNA elsewhere. The name for 10D23 is therefore changed to: HANIFI ROHINGYA NA KHONNA.

T2. Clause 33, Code Charts and list of character names – Latin Extended-D

The USNB supports the current names U+A7B8 LATIN CAPITAL LETTER U WITH STROKE A7B9 LATIN SMALL LETTER U WITH STROKE. There is no consistent naming pattern in UCS names for a letter with “/” (i.e., U+0142, U+019B, U+01FE, U+023A, whose names are all “with stroke”). See also names for U+0244 and U+0289.

Compare:

Horizontal stroke, bar	Diagonal stroke, stroke
U+A792 Ć, U+A793 ċ (<i>Nanai</i>)	U+023B ĸ, U+023C Ĺ (<i>Saanich</i>)
U+AB33 ē (<i>phonetic</i>)	U+0246 Ē, U+0247 ģ (<i>Tepehuán</i>)
U+023D Ł, U+019A ł (<i>Saanich</i>)	U+0141 Ł, U+0142 ł (<i>Polish</i>)
U+019F Ø, U+0275 ø (<i>Tatar</i>)	U+00D8 Ø, U+00F8 ø (<i>Danish</i>)
U+A756 Q, U+A757 q (<i>Latin, Irish, Lezg</i>)	U+A758 Q̇, U+A759 q̇ (<i>Latin</i>)
U+0166 T, U+0167 t (<i>Sami, Saanich</i>)	U+023E Ṫ, U+2C66 ṫ (<i>Saanich</i>)

Proposed change by U.S.A.

Retain the names as listed in the amendment for U+A7B8 and U+A7B9.

Noted

T3. Clause 33, Code Charts and list of character names – Sogdian

The USNB requests that the name for U+10F58 SOGDIAN PUNCTUATION CIRCLES WITH DOTS be changed to SOGDIAN PUNCTUATION TWO CIRCLES WITH DOTS. In sections 3.5 and 5.1 of the original proposal (WG2 N4815) the name SOGDIAN PUNCTUATION TWO CIRCLES WITH DOTS appears. The name with “TWO CIRCLES” is more specific and preferable.

Proposed change by U.S.A.

Correct the name of U+10F58 to SOGDIAN PUNCTUATION TWO CIRCLES WITH DOTS.

Accepted

T4. Clause 33, Code Charts and list of character names – Sogdian

The USNB requests the character name for U+10F45 SOGDIAN PHONOGRAM SHIN be changed to U+10F45 SOGDIAN INDEPENDENT SHIN. While the name “PHONOGRAM” does not appear elsewhere in the UCS, the character is nevertheless a phonogram for the Chinese logogram. The name SOGDIAN INDEPENDENT SHIN is an alternative to “PHONOGRAM.”.

Proposed change by U.S.A.

Change the name of U+10F45 to SOGDIAN INDEPENDENT SHIN.

Accepted

See also comment T6 from UK. Note that the USA and UK disagree on the qualifier of the character (phonogram or not).

T5. Clause 33, Code Charts and list of character names – Transport and Map Symbols

The USNB requests the glyph for U+1F6BE WATER CLOSET be changed from the glyph below left to that shown below right. The current “WC” glyph could be confused with U+1F14F 𐀬 SQUARED WC and U+1F18F 𐀮 NEGATIVE SQUARED WC. The recommended glyph was the original shape when the character was first published in Unicode 6.0 and ISO 10646.



Current: 1F6BE Change to 1F6BE

Proposed change by U.S.A.



Change the glyph for U+1F6BE WATER CLOSET to: 1F6BE

Accepted

ISO/CS editing unit comments

Editorial comments

E1. Page 1, change for page 52-2611, Clause 33.

The editor's note should not be retained for the FDIS submission.

Proposed change by ISOCS.

Delete this note.

Accepted

E2. All

PDF page size is not A4.

Proposed change by ISOCS.

IF FDIS submission is not re-sized at A4, please note that ISOCS will change it to A4 before publication as per ISO/IEC 10646:2017.

Accepted in principle

There is still some limit on what can be done for the code charts as these are shared with the Unicode standard code charts which are laid out in Letter format..

E3. All

Headers and footers read 2017.

Proposed change by ISOCS.

For FDIS submission, remove **Draft Amendment (DAM) 1** and update headers to:

ISO/IEC 10646:2017/Amd.1:2018(E)

Update footers to:

© ISO/IEC 2018 – All rights reserved .

Accepted

E4. All

Style/formatting of text headings, etc., providing details of changes made by this document is not in line with ISO's Model Amendment.

Proposed change by ISOCS.

Match the style of the Model Amd, available at: <https://www.iso.org/drafting-standards.html> .

Accepted

E5. All

The electronic attachments should be added to ISO's URN site as per ISO/IEC 10646:2017.

Proposed change by ISOCS.

Revise the wording in the text to reflect the availability of electronic content online. The blue highlights in the text should be replaced with the following link: <http://standards.iso.org/iso-iec/10646/ed-5/en/amd1/en>

Provide the electronic files separately for the FDIS submission and we will load them onto the URN.

Accepted

E6. Foreword

Updates to Foreword text required.

Proposed change by ISOCS.

Replace para 6 with:

This document was prepared by Technical Committee ISO/IEC JTC 1, *Information technology*, Subcommittee SC 2, *Coded character sets*.

Delete para 7 (This document is the first amendment to the fifth edition (ISO/IEC 10646:2017).).

Replace the first sentence of para 8 with:

This amendment includes the following significant changes with respect to the fifth edition (ISO/IEC 10646:2017): .

Accepted