Document N2634 provides a complete proposal for encoding the Tai Lue (Xishuangbanna Dai) script. This document provides comments on that proposal.

**Character inventory and encoding model**  
The character repertoire and encoding model proposed in N2634 is appropriate and complete for this script.

**Ordering of characters**  
The proposal does not discuss collation issues explicitly. While the encoding order of characters should not be strictly tied to collation order (due to collation, in general, involving greater complexity than can be reflected in code point order of characters alone, as well as variation between cultures), the code point order will influence implementers, and so is an important consideration.

There is some variation in Tai Lue documents and descriptions of Tai Lue with respect to ordering, though one ordering of consonant and vowels seems to prevail. The ordering of consonants in this proposal is corroborated in various sources.

The ordering of vowel symbols can be seen in the following sample:\(^1\)

---

\(^1\) Note that the columns in this chart come in sets of three: the left column has a phonetic transcription, the middle column has the Tai Lue vowel sign, and the right-hand column contains the older writing convention for the Tai Lue language, using a variation of the Lanna script.
The following sample shows a vowel chart that is organized differently. The bottom row contains the diphthongs, however, and if these are placed in order following all the basic vowel symbols, then going through the remainder of the chart by columns from left to right yields exactly the same order as seen in Figure 1.

2 The chart in Figure 1 gives a different order for final consonants than is indicated in the proposal. This source is an exception in this regard, however; the ordering of final consonants in the proposal is corroborated in PSCC and LA1.
The ordering of basic vowel signs in N2634 follows the order shown in Figure 1 and Figure 2. The ordering of diphthong vowel signs differs, however: in N2634, TAI LUE VOWEL SIGN IY ɭɨ is placed third among the diphthongs, whereas it should occur last. The position of this character after all other vowels is seen in Figure 1 and Figure 2 above, as well as in the following sample:

![Tai Lue vowel chart](image)

Thus, I recommend re-assignment of diphthong vowel characters as follows:

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Proposed character</th>
<th>Revised code point</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>19C8 TAI LUE VOWEL SIGN IY ɭɨ</td>
<td>19CC</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>19C9 TAI LUE VOWEL SIGN UY ɰɨ</td>
<td>19C8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>19CA TAI LUE VOWEL SIGN OOY ɰɭ</td>
<td>19C9</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>19CB TAI LUE VOWEL SIGN OY ɭɭ</td>
<td>19CA</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>19CC TAI LUE VOWEL SIGN UEY ɭɭ</td>
<td>19CB</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Table 1. Recommended reassignment of code points for diphthongs

Names of characters

There are four characters for which the names proposed in N2634 should be revised:

**19BC TAI LUE VOWEL SIGN VOWEL SHORTENER ɭɚ.** This character, like the cognate character in Thai and Lao scripts, has two functions: it can be used to represent the short vowel /a/ in open syllables, and it can be used in combination with other vowel signs to denote shortened vowels. Use in an open syllable to represent the short vowel /a/ is seen in the following examples:

---

3 The chart in Figure 2 has a minor typographic error in that, for the diphthong uui, they have used the character ɭɨ, whereas it should be ɭɭ.
The primary identity of this Tai Lue character (as for the corresponding Thai and Lao characters) is in its function of representing short /a/. For instance, note that, in the vowel charts in Figure 1, Figure 2 and Figure 3, it is presented as short /a/, and is paired with the sign for long /aː/, \(\textcircled{a} \textcircled{a} \). Thus, I recommend that this character be renamed as TAI LUE VOWEL SIGN A.

19C2 TAI LUE VOWEL SIGN E \(\textcircled{a} \textcircled{a} \). This character represents a distinct vowel quality then 19C1 TAI LUE VOWEL SIGN EE \(\textcircled{a} \textcircled{a} \), not a shortened counterpart to it as the name suggests. I recommend that this character be renamed as TAI LUE VOWEL SIGN AE.

19DE TAI LUE SIGN AND \(\textcircled{a} \textcircled{a} \) and 19DF TAI LUE SIGN RESULTATIVE \(\textcircled{a} \textcircled{a} \). These characters are abbreviations for the frequently-used morphemes /lɛ/ ‘and’, and /lɛːw/. The latter is a particle that indicates perfective aspect (completion), not a resulting state. Thus, if the name of the character were to be based on its meaning, it should be called “perfective” rather than “resultative”.

Rather than basing names of these characters on English glosses of the morphemes they denote, however, I recommend that they have names indicative of their pronunciation. This would be consistent with the names used in earlier proposals submitted by the China national body (N2242, N2371), and in earlier contributions from Michael Eversion (N2044) and the current author (L2/99-243). Thus, 19DE TAI LUE SIGN LAE, and 19DF TAI LUE SIGN LAEW.

**Conclusion**

With the exception of a few details that have been noted, this proposal is sound. I recommend that it be approved by WG2 and UTC with the recommended revisions discussed herein.

---

4 The term *resultative* is used in linguistics to refer to an expression that describes an action along with a resulting state caused by that action; e.g., “He boiled the kettle dry.”
References


N2634 Eversion, Michael. 2003. “Proposal to encode the Tai Lue script in the BMP of the UCS.”

Comments on N2634 Page 5 of 5
Peter Constable October 16, 2003