

ISO/IEC JEC 1/SC 2/WG 2 N 3468

Title: Collected comments on Japanese TV Symbols (WG2 N3397)

Source: Masahiro Sekiguchi (An expert contribution)

Date: 2008-4-22

Listed here are comments received from several reviewers of N3397 in Japan national body. This is just a collection of independent review comments for discussion and does not form a single opinion. I hope this contribution helps improving the proposal.

1. On page 1, "Status", it says "Duplicate within the ARIB set (such as 9058 and 9330)". However, ARIB 9058 and ARIB 9330 are not duplicate; they are two separate characters having different meanings although the shapes are similar. ARIB 9058 is a sign for "a TV program broadcasted with two audio channels", and ARIB 9330 is for "a second baseman (of baseball)". It is questionable to map ARIB 9058 and ARIB 9330 into a single UCS codepoint.
2. On page 9, the ARIB column for a newly proposed UCS 1F203 (CIRCLED CJK UNIFIED IDEOGRAPH-7B8F) shows 9054, but it should read 9288.
3. On "circled CJK unified ideographs" on page 9, squared CJK unified ideographs on page 10 and 11, and "Tortoise shell bracketed CJK Unified Ideographs" on page 11 and 12, the names of the listed characters use UCS codepoint to identify the enclosed ideographs. However, they should follow the existing practice for enclosed ideographs, that is, to use descriptive English words based on the meanings of the enclosed ideographs.
4. On page 16, question 2, it states "contact has been made to members of the user community", and shows "Japanese Standardization body". The name of the body should be stated clearly, since we have no idea which body the author has contacted.
5. On page 16, question 9, it says:
Can any of the proposed characters be encoded using a composed character sequence of either existing characters or other proposed characters? Yes?
If YES, is a rationale for its inclusion provided? Yes
If YES, reference: This document
However it is unsure which part of this document is the rationale.
6. On page 19, there are five "Parenthesized and Circled Ideographs". Five ARIB symbols, ARIB 9242 to 9246 are shown with a round parentheses in the document N3397, but the ARIB standard shows these symbols with parentheses similar to white tortois shell brackets (cf. U+3018 and U+3019.) It is not sure we can map them to existing UCS parenthesized ideographs.
7. On page 21, the glyph for ARIB9312 is shown as 大正, but it should be 平成. It should be mapped to U+337B but U+337D. (The name of the UCS character to be mapped, SQUARE ERA NAME HEISEI, is correct.)