To: UTC
From: Debbie Anderson, SEI, UC Berkeley
Date: 4 August 2014
Subject: Feedback on Mandaic Shaping as noted in Public Review L2/14-179

Summary:

In the Public Feedback document L2/14-179, Benjamin Riefenstahl reported an apparent error in the Mandaic block intro (specifically, the tables for "Dual-Joining Mandaic Characters" and "Right-Joining Mandaic Characters") and entries in ArabicShaping.txt.

I forwarded the questions to Dr Brian Mubaraki, who was the Mandaic expert with whom we consulted on the proposal, and I also reviewed the relevant documents. I attach a chart by Dr. Mubaraki with the joining features. (Sample text in Mandaic is available upon request from Dr. Mubaraki.)

As noted by Benjamin Riefenstahl and corroborated by Dr. Mubaraki, the following changes should be made:
1. In the core spec, correct the Character Name in Table 9-20 "Right-Joining Mandaic Characters" from "IN" to "IT" (but retain the glyphs)
(Current entry)

2. In ArabicShaping.txt, make the following changes
a. change current entry from:
0847; MANDAIC IT; D; No_Joining_Group
to:
0847; MANDAIC IT; R; No_Joining_Group

b. change current entry from:
084F; MANDAIC IN; R; No_Joining_Group
to:
084F; MANDAIC IN; D; No_Joining_Group

Note: Brian Riefenstahl had mentioned in his feedback that "the correct characters in the table should be (in this order) * Dual-Joining: ATT, AK, AL, AM, AS, IN, AP, ASZ, AQ, AR, AT."
However, he left out AN. The correct order should be: * Dual-Joining: ATT, AK, AL, AM, **AN,** AS, IN, AP, ASZ, AQ, AR, AT."

Background on the error:
The original proposal (L2/08-270) contained errors in the joining behavior charts: under "Dual-joining Mandaic Characters" it listed the name as "IT" instead of the name "IN", and under "Right-joining Mandaic Characters" it lists the name as "IN" instead of "IT".

The tables in the Unicode Standard 6.2 continued the errors (with the incorrect character name "IT" in Table 14.5, the incorrect names and glyphs in Table 14.6 for "IN" and "AKSA").

The "Joining types for Mandaic" document by Roozbeh Pournader (L2/10-413) also had the error:
0847; MANDAIC IT; D; No_Joining_Group (should have been "R")
084F; MANDAIC IN; R; No_Joining_Group (should have been "D")

Comment	English Equivalent	Variation when joining	Mandaic Alphabet
Only joins text from the right side associated with a shape change. No join on left.	A	�	ᴑ
Joins both left and right no shape change	B		
Joins both left and right no shape change	G		
Joins both left and right no shape change	D		
Joins both left and right no shape change	H		
Joins both left and right no shape change	U/W		
Joins text only from the right side, no shape change is associated with the join	Z		
Joins text only from the right side, no shape change is associated with the join	*hu*		
Joins both left and right no shape change	Tee		
Joins text only from the right side, no shape change is associated with the join	I/Y		
Joins the text from both the right and left, if it joins text on the right only no shape change. If it joins on the left a shape change occurs	K		
Joins both left and right no shape change	L		
Joins both left and right no shape change	M		

Joins the text from both the right and left, if it joins text on the right only no shape change. If it joins on the left a shape change occurs	N	ע	ע
Joins both left and right no shape change	S		ܩ
Joins both left and right no shape change	`		ܟ
Joins the text from both the right and left, if it joins text on the right only no shape change. If it joins on the left a shape change occurs	P/F	ܩ	ܩ
Joins the text from both the right and left, if it joins text on the right only no shape change. If it joins on the left a shape change occurs	S	ע̃	ע̃
Joins both left and right no shape change	Q		ܩ
Joins both left and right no shape change	R		ܪ
Joins text only from the right side, no shape change is associated with the join. No join on left	sh		ܦ
Joins both left and right no shape change	T		ܬ
Does not join to text on left or right and does not lead to shape change	id		ܙ

Prepared by Dr Brian Mubaraki, 4th August 2014 in response to questions/clarification required by Ms. Deb Anderson for the Mandaic fonts project.

I have attached text that has been widely published in 2000-2010 in this language using this font and this style.