

Title: Feedback on L2/20-209 and some information for the shakuhachi musical notation

Author: Eiso Chan

Date: 2020-09-18

This document provides my individual feedback comment on [L2/20-209](#).

1. Feedback on the character names of tone marks

In the proposal, the author proposed 13 tone marks, and there are two types of character names there. In Page 4 and 5, they are `MODIFIER LETTER KATAKANA HOKKIEN TONE xxx` and `MODIFIER LETTER KATAKANA HOKKIEN NASALIZED TONE xxx`; in Page 12, they are `MODIFIER LETTER KATAKANA TONE xxx` and `MODIFIER LETTER KATAKANA NASALIZED TONE xxx`.

Hokkien is not a former name for this dialect / language in mainland China and Taiwan. In [ISO 639-3](#), its name is *Min Nan Chinese*, and the language code is `nan`. If the language name is suitable for the character names, it is better to change to `MODIFIER LETTER KATAKANA MIN NAN TONE xxx` and `MODIFIER LETTER KATAKANA MIN NAN NASALIZED TONE xxx`; if not, Type 2 will be better.

Type	Character Name
Type 1	<code>MODIFIER LETTER KATAKANA MIN NAN TONE xxx</code> <code>MODIFIER LETTER KATAKANA MIN NAN NASALIZED TONE xxx</code>
Type 2	<code>MODIFIER LETTER KATAKANA TONE xxx</code> <code>MODIFIER LETTER KATAKANA NASALIZED TONE xxx</code>

2. Feedback on the combining characters

The author also mentioned two combining characters for Katakana letters, one is `COMBINING (KATAKANA) DOT BELOW`, the other one is `COMBINING (KATAKANA) OVERLINE`. In the proposal, the author maps them to the encoded characters as below.

UCS	Character Name	Unicode Character Name
U+0323	<code>COMBINING (KATAKANA) DOT BELOW</code>	<code>COMBINING DOT BELOW</code>
U+0305	<code>COMBINING (KATAKANA) OVERLINE</code>	<code>COMBINING OVERLINE</code>

In general vertical layout, the dot outline of U+0323 should be set on the left, and the bar outline of U+0305 should be set on the right, but for the Taiwanese Kana use, they should be set on the bottom and the top as the same as the horizontal layout. They are not the characters used for the East Asian text commonly.

It looks better to add these rules to [UAX #50](#) in future, which will make the font developer and type designer easy to make the font well and match the real usage. However, I find out the use for the right bar of overline with the Katakana letters in the vertical layout.

Please see the pictures in [this website](#). This is a type of Japanese traditional musical notation for [shakuhachi \(Tozan Ryu\)](#) in this book. Therefore, there are two possibilities for U+0305 in the vertical layout.

I suggest the following method to handle these two combining characters for the digitization.

- Add the information for the Taiwanese Kana use of U+0323 and U+0305 to `NameList.txt` in UCD
- Add the entries of U+0323 and U+0305 to UAX #50, but show two types of glyphs for the `vertical` column in Table 2
- Register a specific `gsub` feature for the combining characters of the Taiwanese Kana use in [ISO/IEC 14496-22](#) and [OpenType](#) in future, such as `skhc`

There is no any VS for the combining characters in the current `StandardizedVariants.txt`, I don't know if it's suitable to use SVS for the combining characters.

Notice that there are more issues which need to solve for the shakuhachi musical notation, Tozan Ryu and Kinko Ryu included. Maybe I will submit the proposal(s) to clarify them in future if possible.

3. Acknowledgement

Mr. Kushim Jiang and Mr. Yifan Wang provide some helps for this document.

(End of Document)