

This is an English translation (by O. Anand) of the original Mongolian document MWG/3-N21.

Also note that the commented document MWG/3-N8 (*Towards a well-formed Mongolian specification that allows interoperable implementations*) received a major revision (MWG/3-N8R) on its presentation day (4 April 2019).

* * *

For the meeting about Mongolian encoding in 3rd of April in Ulaanbaatar:

After reading Mr Liang Hai 梁海's article named "Towards a well-formed Mongolian specification that allows interoperable implementations" which published on 20th of March...

I have been reading Mr Liang Hai's articles about Mongolian Encoding, not a few times. I didn't think that this one was different from the previous ones. I thought that again, I read what I've been reading and he wrote what he has been writing! But it might be unethical to give no response after reading someone's article, so I decided to say a few comments:

First of all, how should I understand Mr Liang Hai's "precious idea" about Mongolian encoding? Before all, I thought that there was nothing new or nothing updated, and nothing that could interest people.

Any writing system or it's encoding cannot be studied separately from **the language** it is used for, and **the orthography rules of the language!**

Mr Liang Hai is underestimating the Mongolian script as a young script even that it cannot differentiate vowels and consonants, the few vowels it is used to write and has no efficient joining rules! Also, denying the truly phonetic alphabet which has a continuous history of at least 800 years of learning, teaching, researching and using and also it's complete, efficient, perfect orthographical rules.

There is one reason behind it. If we try to make someone who doesn't know the Mongolian language to read Mongolian script, there might be a problem that he couldn't read it correctly! He wouldn't probably recognise either the "ᠠ" which is the vowel "a" or "e" in the words "ᠠᠨᠠᠭ" and "ᠠᠨᠠᠭ" and also, he can't find the right pronunciation of the "ᠡ" in the middle of a word! But if it's given to the person who knows the Mongolian language, who reads the script and uses it, he would probably find out the right pronunciation of these letters that indicate more than one phoneme. It is needless to say that anywhere anytime people cannot pronounce a few words used very rare.

It is so normal to not know the pronunciation if someone doesn't know the language and this can happen in English, Japanese and Chinese! It's probably not the mistake only Mongolian has! In the transliteration of Chinese "a" as used to transliterate "烟" as yān

but we pronounce as [yæn] and probably not as [yan]. How can we make someone who doesn't know Chinese to differentiate the "xing" and "hang" pronunciation of the character "行"! Mongolian orthography is the rule based on the knowledge of the Mongolian language. So, it is a useless thing to search for the disadvantages of Mongolian script independently from the Mongolian language, the history of Mongolian script, and the usage of Mongolians.

There's also one important thing which should be noted. If the current situation of the computer system and the language system differ, which is better, the computing system follows the language system and make necessary change within its system or another way around? In my opinion, better is probably rational that the updating computer system should implement the new language system.

Talking until this point, I've got one thought: Our Mr Liang tried so hard and finally proposing to put the 20th century Mongolian into 70 years old Mongolian-Manchu writing machine that made in German! I, myself, saw that writing machine and tried to write some Mongolian words on that. He is proposing "the great idea" to put Mongolian script and the encoding of Mongolian script to go back 70 years to the time of the era of writing machines besides the whole world shifted to the computational era of the 20th century!

Secondly, International Mongolian encoding which published in 2000, Mongolian script encoding national standard of Mongolian which passed in 2000, and our country's Mongolian script standard, all of them included Mongolian, Todo, Manchu, Sibe scripts. But Mr Liang Hai's "Proposal of Mongolian script encoding" didn't include three of them except Mongolian. What is the reason behind this? He didn't say anything about it besides all the standards, is it because he has got supreme knowledge or showing his greatness by not seeing the daily usage of all of the four scripts in our PRC? Should he think about what will happen if one-day newspapers, textbooks, websites which uses those scripts stopped publishing? Should he think about what's the result when researches are no longer related to daily life?!

I think that these three scripts are the scripts that our country can't be without their usage even one single day. Isn't it needed to remind you that the right to use these scripts are protected by the constitution of our country!?

Thirdly, in all the standards of Mongolian script encoding, they included the Ali-Gali of Mongolian, Todo and Manchu. But our Mr Liang Hai by not saying a single word about Ali-Gali in his encoding, he removed the Ali-Gali script! The Ali-Gali script of these three scripts is the heritage of communication of multiple languages and the knowledge of scripts and also a great historical creation and a contribution of the knowledge of scripts. Why he removed them without saying anything? Might be an influence of some Mongolians who either doesn't know the Ali-Gali script or the importance of the history of Mongolian script?! Anyway, the Ali-Gali of Mongolian, Todo, and Manchu cannot be removed! It is the way that people show their image of not understanding and caring for the history of their script, and not being confident about their own culture!?

Therefore, we are not possible to accept the idea of removing Ali-Gali script from the encoding!

Finally, are those ideas from Mr Liang Hai “Ideas from hell” or “Project from Devil” or “Chinese omen”? I can’t figure it out!

Choijinjab from the University of Inner Mongolia
31st of March, 2019

* EOF *