Attachment 8 - USA

WG2 2237
Date: August 23, 2000

Title:	Comments accompanying the US positive vote on CD ISO/IEC 10646-2
Source:	The U.S.A.
Action:	Forward to SC2 Secretariat

The US is voting YES on the Final Committee Draft ISO/IEC 10646-2 with the following comments:

Technical Comments:

T.1 Clause 4: part-2 hex notation
5-digit notation should be used for part-2 characters. Part 2 only deals with characters from Plane 1, 2 and E, and all these codes can be expressed in 5 hex digit. BMP characters will still use 4 hex digits in appropriate context. The same convention should apply to the name for CJK characters (unified and compatibility) in clause 11.2 and 11.3.

T.2 Clause 6: SMP description
In the Note, change 'CJK Ideographic derived scripts' to 'Non CJK Ideographic scripts'.

T.3 Clause 8: SPP description
Change '0EF0FF' to 'E0FFF', to correctly reflect accepted UK comment T.5 on the CD ballot. Change 'annex F' to 'clause 10'.

T.4 Clause 10: Etruscan
Change the name of the 'Etruscan block' to 'Old Italic block'; modify character names and collection accordingly. Change the beginning of the Note as following:
"The Old Italic block covers alphabets such as Estruscan, Oscan, Umbrian and Faliscan. These alphabets can be found..."
Remove the following characters from the Etruscan block: 10320 ETRUSCAN WORD SEPARATOR, 10326-10329 ETRUSCAN NUMERAL ALTERNATE ONE HUNDRED to ETRUSCAN NUMERAL ONE THOUSAND OR TEN THOUSAND. They need further study before being encoded.

T.5 Clause 10: Deseret
Remove extra space in 10428 DESERET SMALL LETTER LONG I name in all occurrences.

T.6 Clause 10: Byzantine Musical symbols
Remove Greek from all character names (consistency with block name). Use 'MUSICAL SYMBOL' instead of 'SIGN' in names (consistency with the other musical block naming). Remove all parenthetical notes in the character names about their level. Although it would be useful and was requested by BSI in a former ballot, there is no agreement among experts at this point to justify their inclusion.
The font should be improved, many characters are too small.
Two characters do not have 'SIGN' in their name: 1D0B6 and 1D0D6, is this an oversight? It seems that all characters should have 'SIGN' in their name or 'MUSICAL SYMBOL' as suggested above.

T.7 Clause 10: Western Musical symbol

Remove 'WESTERN' from block, collection and character names. These symbols are used worldwide and the extra qualifier makes the names too long.

1D100-1D102 should be removed (according to the WG2 resolution adding the repertoire).

1D13E is a presentation variant of 1D13D and should be removed.

The characters 'MUSICAL SYMBOL END OF STIMME', 'MUSICAL SYMBOL SINGLE BAR and MUSICAL SYMBOL DOUBLE BAR' should be added for completeness.

The US also desires a re-order of the block to better reflect character classification.

T.8 Clause 10: Mathematical

Bold Fraktur characters should replace the Open Face Italic characters. This was a mistake by the US when transposing the proposal from the original submitter.

Change 'OPEN FACE' by 'DOUBLE STRUCK' in character names to be consistent with Part 1. This includes letters and digits.

The font used for Open Face should be similar to the one used for Part 1 charts.

The chart shows incorrect characters for 1D42C-1D42F.

Math Greek character glyphs need a better font.

Script and Fraktur fonts need to be reviewed by the Math community.

T.9 Clause 11: CJK Extension B

Characters 29C1C and 29D52 are in error. Furthermore the US requests that the changes introduced by the last IRG meeting in China (June 2000) be reflected in clause 11. IRG has committed to provide them before the next WG2 meeting.

T.10 Clause 11: Compatibility characters

There are 8 holes in the range 2F800-2FA16: 2F832, 2F933 and 2F96A-2F96F. These should be removed and the following characters should be moved up accordingly.

There is at least a mapping error: 2F90C is mapped incorrectly to 707D. it should be 7070.

T.11 Clause 12: SPP

Correct the Figure 3 plane name

Add the approved comment J-2 from last disposition of comment.

In clause 12.2 Annex D should be Annex E.

T.12 Annex A.1

Change 'CJK COMPATIBILITY IDEOGRAPHS EXTENSION A' to 'CJK COMPATIBILITY IDEOGRAPHS SUPPLEMENT'

Change 'ALTERNATE FORMAT CHARACTERS EXTENDED' to 'ALTERNATE FORMAT CHARACTERS'.

Remove the Note. It is meaningless (as a consequence of the CD ballot comments)

T.13 Annex A.3

Change '20100' to '20000' as the staring point for the CJK Extension B range.

Change '2FA1F' to '2FA0F' (due to holes being removed)

T.14 Annex B.1

Remove 1D134 and 1D135 (Fermata and Fermata under).

Add the following:

MUSICAL SYMBOL STEM
MUSICAL SYMBOL SPRECHGSANG STEM
MUSICAL SYMBOL TREMOLO ONE
MUSICAL SYMBOL TREMOLO TWO
MUSICAL SYMBOL TREMOLO THREE
MUSICAL SYMBOL AUGMENTATION DOT
MUSICAL SYMBOL FLAG ONE

MUSICAL SYMBOL FLAG TWO
MUSICAL SYMBOL FLAG THREE
MUSICAL SYMBOL FLAG FOUR
MUSICAL SYMBOL FLAG FIVE

T.15 Annex F.1
As a consequence of comment T.6 , references to parenthetic notations (u, m and l) should be removed.

T.16 Annex F.2
Remove the following text fragments "Although these characters are not formally...STEM PLUS FLAG FIVE" and "For Example: ....MUSICAL SYMBOL STACCATO". These text fragments introduce classification and equivalences that are out of scope of this standard.

Editorial Comments:
E.1 Clause 10, 11 and 12
These clauses should be consecutive without any charts between them. At this point it is very easy to miss clause 11 and 12 as they interspersed in long chart tables.
The charts should also include the plane value in the hex headers (going from 3 to 4 hex digits) and the hex value in the chart cells (from 4 to 5 hex digits)

E.2 Annex A
Change 'from to' to 'positions'.

E.3 Annex C and D
Annex D should become a plain text file accessible as a separate file on a CD-ROM distribution media or as a http link on a online media. This would make Annex D much more usable than the current multi-column format. Annex C should also be linked through http.

E.4 Annex A
Change 'from to' to 'positions'.

End of US comments